JIHOČESKÁ UNIVERZITA V ČESKÝCH BUDĚJOVICÍCH

FILOZOFICKÁ FAKULTA

ÚSTAV ANGLISTIKY

DIPLOMOVÁ PRÁCE

THE ROLE OF GAZE IN VICTORIAN GHOST STORIES

Vedoucí práce: Einat Adar, M.A., Ph.D.

Autor práce: Bc. Michaela Doležalová

Studijní obor: Americká a anglická literatura

Ročník: 2.

2024

I confirm that this thesis is my work written using solely the sources and literature properly quoted and acknowledged as work cited.

25. 7. 2024 Český Krumlov ……

Bc. Michaela Doležalová

Poděkování

I would like to thank my supervisor Einat Adar, M.A., Ph.D. for her professional guidance, helpfulness, patience, comments and advice, and most importantly her friendly attitude that made writing this thesis easier.

Abstrakt

Cílem diplomové práce je zaměřit se na dvě známá díla z viktoriánské doby od Elizabeth Gaskell a Emily Brontë a poukázat na důležitou roli zraku jako smyslu v "The Old Nurse's Story" a *Wuthering Heights* v několika jeho formách jako například jeho důležitost při pozorování či vidění něčeho nadpřirozeného. V teoretické části se zaměřím na viktoriánskou dobu a její pohled na duchy a zároveň představím důležité teorie, které jsou význačné pro zrak či pohled.

V praktické části se pak zaměřím na interpretaci obou děl se zaměřením na roli vizí a zraku.

Klíčová slova: duchařský příběh, duch, viktoriánská doba, spiritualismus, zrak, pohled

Abstract

This thesis aims to focus on two well-known works from the Victorian era by Elizabeth Gaskell and Emily Brontë and to highlight the important role of sight as a sense in “The Old Nurse's Story” and *Wuthering Heights* in several of its forms, such as its importance in observing or seeing something supernatural.

In the theoretical part, I will focus on the Victorian era and its view on ghosts while introducing important theories significant to sight and gaze.

In the practical part, I will then focus on interpreting both works, focusing on the role of visions and gaze.

Keywords: ghost story, ghost, Victorian era, spiritualism, sight, gaze

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1 Introduction

My thesis delves into Victorian perceptions and fascination with the supernatural, specifically ghosts, and their belief in the afterlife, which arose thanks to the popularisation of Spiritualism. The Victorian period in literature is known for the genre of ghost stories, influenced by this nineteenth-century movement, that became instant bestsellers and classics. With that being mentioned, the crucial aspect of ghost stories is our gaze, which will be the main focus in analysing the works, mainly the idea of what one is seeing and what it means or what one's gaze can reveal about them, alongside the importance of an eyewitness, which is a crucial role in ghost stories, someone who provides the information on what had happened. The reason why I am discussing this is because, in terms of ghost stories, we tend to focus mainly on the actual ghost-seeing and how much we can trust our sight, however, the role of gaze is more complex in ghost stories and can provide other interesting aspects in terms of analysis.

The focus is on two Victorian works. One of which is by Emily Brontë, who in her short life, wrote only one novel, *Wuthering Heights,* published in 1847, that was considered controversial when it first came out for its content, a complex story that provides more than just one famous ghost episode. The other work is a typical ghost story "The Old Nurse's Story" written by Elizabeth Gaskell and published in 1852, one of her most famous and well-read short stories intertwined with ghosts and phantoms. Both works might seem relatively different but they have a lot in common, not only ghosts. Both stories stand by the famous Victorian mantra 'seeing is believing', which will be discussed, they

have narrators who are new to the setting, who learn about the events through characters who lived it and know more than them, and both stories are also intertwined with the uncanny.

In the theoretical part, I will focus on the Victorian period in which both works were published and were therefore influenced by that time, be it the society or the mentioned movement of spiritualism, which will be discussed in more detail to provide the understanding of the society's interest in the supernatural, or more specifically the dead. I will then mention the perception of the gaze in the Victorian society context to ghost seeing, alongside theories focusing on gaze that are relevant to this thesis.

In the practical part, I will compare the two works specifically. I will analyse the importance of an eyewitness and how important is the impact of seeing ghosts with one's own eyes. Moreover, I will pay attention to the role of the uncanny which creates an eerie atmosphere in such works. Overall, my thesis aims to analyse the works and the pivotal characters and provide a view into the importance of the gaze in various forms, which they provide.

2 PART ONE

1.1 The Ghost Story

Both *Wuthering Heights* by Emily Brontë and the short story "The Old Nurse's Story" by Elizabeth Gaskell are ghost stories from the Victorian Era, known for a large empire and scientific and economic changes. This chapter will provide a general depiction of Victorian society to understand the era before focusing on the ghost story itself.

Furthermore, I will describe Spiritualism and its relevance to the topic of my MA thesis, which focuses on gaze and vision in ghost stories. Including Spiritualism in the framework of this thesis enhances the understanding of why ghost stories became a popular genre at that time and acknowledges the importance of gaze and vision. In the subchapter, I will begin with an overview of why Victorian society was interested in ghosts and Spiritualism.

The Victorian period was well known for its expansion of the Empire, rising levels of education, literacy, and urbanisation that led people to move from villages to cities and their new houses with servants, who were usually the first to encounter ghosts or anything supernatural (Freeman 106). The nineteenth century was a time with "high mortality rates, very public displays of death and mourning and […] increasing scepticism" (106). Zoe Lehmann Imfield notes that those factors were, among other reasons, why the Victorians' uncertainty and their lifestyles fuelled an interest in the supernatural, specifically ghost stories (Imfeld 5).

Similarly, Scott Brewster argues the same by stating that "Victorian literary ghosts have tended to be treated as metaphors or cyphers for 'a spectrum of

social anxieties of the day' that include the decline of the Christian faith, the contrasted political, social and legal position of women, and the increasing invisibility of financial exchange" (Brewster 224).

Thus, during the nineteenth century, the ghost story became a distinct genre of mainly short fiction with a clever and "spooky anecdote" (Freeman 93). It should be pointed out that even though readers enjoy reading a ghost story, this genre has frequently been criticised by critics because, by design, any troubles or horrors are overcome when we have a survivor narrating or focalising the experience, so it is clear from the beginning it all ends well at the end (Smith 94).

Ghosts in ghost stories, Imfield argues, mostly haunt the houses or manors of their owners and bring the feeling of unrest and horror (Imfeld 5). The role ghosts play in those stories, in general, is the role that showcases what was lost and can no longer be experienced, "a lived relationship to the past" (5). For instance, Andrew Smith notes that in the nineteenth-century ghost stories, the houses are 'invaded' by ghosts (Smith 89). In some cases, the story suggests that a home is a dangerous and unsafe place. The owners can experience anxieties about the unknown, the foreign, or the money they invested into their home and feel "middle-class concerns about who really 'owns' such places" (89). Therefore, it can be said that the ghosts represent social and economic anxieties (117). Ghosts are spectral beings, however, they are also more than that; they serve as "political entities," as Smith calls them, which is how the Gothic genre manages to hold onto its seemingly radical possibilities. Ghosts are living, breathing reminders of the limitations of bourgeois culture, and their spectral presence indicates that radicalism is still alive and well, "waiting because it has

not quite been laid to rest" (Smith 71). In addition, Julia Briggs suggests that "ghost stories often deal with the most primitive, punitive, and sadistic of impulses, revenge being one of the commonest motifs present in the form" (Briggs 128). They also embody "fears too deep and too important to be expressed more directly" (23).

During the 1840s and onward, ghost stories experienced a surge in popularity. They became a literary form that was in demand, especially by female writers such as Charlotte Riddell, Amelia Edwards, Margaret Oliphant and Elizabeth Gaskell, of course (Brewster 228). Gaskell's interest in the supernatural is "well-documented" through her letters where she shares her attraction towards the supernatural (Martin 29). Those female writers could showcase their talent in short stories, which were in high demand and be the influence that helped to shape the literary form of a ghost story thematically and also stylistically (Brewster 228). Not only could female writers showcase their talent, but ghost stories also provided "special kinds of freedom," which did not only require including fantasy and the supernatural, but they could also use the stories to criticise what was against their values (Wallace 57). Moreover, Clara Hanson argues that short stories, overall, provide a different kind of experience than novels (Ludlow and Styler 2). She suggests an interesting idea regarding the structure of ghost stories, saying that they are "the most literary form of all because it is 'the narrative art form most closely associated with a dream.'" (Wallace 58). Specifically, "the relations between events/images in a short story are often random and arbitrary, 'impelled' […] by unconscious forces rather than logical or rational temporal sequences" (58). It is common for dreams to blur the lines between imagination and reality, which happens in ghost stories, too.

Hanson elaborates that those stories have in common with dreams, the feeling of strangeness and familiarity that is connected to the uncanny, which will be discussed later alongside dreams (58).

The ghost stories were challenges for the writers since they could explore the mystery of life after death (Freeman 106). As stated before, ghost stories were seemingly favourite literary forms, and with their rise to fame, the supernatural and the figure of the ghost were scrutinised scientifically and philosophically (Brewster 224). Gothic writers believed that ghost stories were mainly successful when they were seemingly short with a so-called 'episode' where a character encounters a ghost since novels could struggle with unnecessary details that were missing the element of supernatural and scary (94). However, if a skilled writer took on the task of writing a novel with a ghostly 'episode,' it could "add a new depth and resonance to apparently realistic fiction" (94): the ghost of Catherine Earnshaw, who haunts and terrifies Lockwood in *Wuthering Heights* is a perfect chilling example of a 'realistic' work being disrupted with a gothic element that turns the 'normal' world into an illogical one (94). Furthermore, it was uncommon for this type of literature to provide "a point of view of the monster" (Halberstam 21).

1.2 Ghosts

Since I will be focusing on the actual ghosts in the analysed works too, I would like to briefly introduce ghosts outside of their literature context and meanings and depict them as supernatural beings as well.

Most classically, a ghost is understood as the "spirit of someone who has died" (Morton 2). Ghosts are usually connected to architecture or family ties, especially if grief is involved. The presence of a ghost can be found through

rapping and banging sounds, as well as music, smells or “the sensation of being touched” (2). Ghosts can also be referred to as apparitions, “a force from the past, from which nothing but its incalculable, if invariably unpleasant, effect may follow” (Tamen 295). Daniel Defoe also wrote a study about apparitions called *The History and Reality of Apparitions* (1727). He describes them as “the invisible inhabitants of the unknown world […] who assume human shapes, or other shapes, and” make themselves visible to us so we can see them and communicate with them" (Defoe 15). He further points out, that those entities shall make themselves known through “dream, vision, appearance” (30).

The meaning of ghosts has changed over the centuries. Geoffrey Chaucer, the great Medieval poet, was the one who created the definition of a “dead spirit that appears to the living” and attributed it to ghosts (Morton 5). Morton also focuses on the concept of ghosts and raises the question of how a ghost differs from a soul. She argues that religions understand the soul to be inside every person and survive after death. But the difference with a ghost is when it comes to “interaction with the living,” for a ghost “must be seen, heard or otherwise experienced [tangibly] by the living” (6). In general, they are often described as “translucent or dim” when seen (6). Furthermore, she wonders if a “dead spirit encountered in a dream” is a ghost. Such dreams are referred to as ‘visitation dreams’ by psychologists, and according to those psychologists they help with the grieving process (8).

1.2.1 Spiritualism

Spiritualism in the Victorian period provided a sense of security for the society interested in existential questions, such as the mysteriousness of the afterlife, by offering them answers through communications with the dead. A

significant reason Victorian society was drawn to the supernatural was the crisis of the Christian faith, which led to Biblical criticism since Spiritualism provided a new look on the afterlife because it had better and "more acceptable eschatology than Christianity," which was the already mentioned possible communication with the deceased (Lamont 898). The crisis was connected to Darwinism as well since Charles Darwin, in his evolution theory, explains creation differently than what people read in the Bible about the miracles that had no evidence, which became an issue for some believers (898). Janet Oppenheim states that Spiritualism provided safety and helped soothe "individual fears about man's future state" (Oppenheim 64). Additionally, the nineteenth-century era was called the 'era of mourning' because the society struggled with the idea of death, not only because of their death, but they struggled more with the idea of losing someone dear to them forever (Geerken 374). For those reasons, Spiritualism became a "new form of personal religion, one which provided the much-desired proof of human immortality" (80). So it was inevitable that the idea that the supernatural exists was thrilling since it meant immortality of the soul, that there was some life after life. They did not have to fear losing their family members, loved ones or friends.

What made Victorian society even more intriguing was the widely spread belief that it was possible to capture spirits in a photograph, meaning that if, for example, a family member took a photo, a spirit appeared in the photography, who was usually a relative of the photographed person, which "helped Victorians conceptualise the nature of the soul and the afterlife" (Cadwallader 16). Such images served for speculations about what the captured spirit is doing after death, and Victorians then could "plot out a reassuring version of the

afterlife" (17). Spirit photographs had a significant role in calming a fear about collective souls, which the photographs refuted since they showed spirits with discrete bodies after death with the same physical appearance and wearing clothes (17). Which seemed "to suggest that the self is retained in the afterlife and that the dissolution into the collective soul that so many feared does not occur" (17). What Cadwallader meant by a "collective soul" was the society's fear that once they die, they disappear and turn into one soul with other deceased people after death and lose their own identity. Furthermore, the fact the spirit chose to appear in a photo confirms that wilful action remains after death, and some people believed it meant the spirit still cared for the person in the photograph (18). Most importantly, it helped Victorians "move beyond grief" with the message of ultimate hope (20).

Notably, Catherine Crowe was a significant figure for Spiritualism in England since the movement influenced the way Victorian society understood the spectre, and her stories are based on the same manifest as Spiritualism (Chapin 157). In addition, ghost stories are oral tales traditionally, and Crowe is a significant figure of oral tradition, who published one of the most notable ghost studies, *The Night Side of Nature*, in 1848 (Heholt 25). This book is a collection of folk tales, where she collected stories from other people she met or stories they sent to her about ghost-seeing, as well as her own (25). She held on to the opinion that those stories deserved serious attention since she believed them to be true (25). The work is considered to be subjective since it focuses on individual experiences of ghost-seeing through senses, such as "sight, sound and bodily reactions to grief and terror" (25).

To understand the movement, we need to start in America in 1848 in a farmhouse in Hydesville, New York, where the Fox sisters, Leah, Margaretta and Catherine, lived (Chapin 157). Ironically, it all started with a mischievous joke on their parents - the two younger sisters, Leah and Margaretta, instead of sleeping in their beds, took apples from a cellar and tied them to strings to create mysterious ‘rapping’ sounds on the floor of their bedroom to scare their superstitious parents, especially their mother, who afterwards believed they had a spirit at home since the girls denied being involved in any of it (157). Their mother was convinced they had a ghost, who even communicated with them through sounds, once the girls started using their knuckles to make other sounds, making their parents believe the spirit was responding to their questions (157). Through this questioning, the Fox family with their neighbours, who joined them, believed the rapper was a ghost of a murdered man haunting the spot where he was killed in the house (Pimple 78). There was a common belief that a person who died violently or accidentally could not rest in a grave peacefully, which is why they thought that was the reason for his presence (86). It did not take long for everyone present during the encounters to realise that the ghost mainly communicated with them when the two youngest daughters of the Fox family were present, which led to the belief that the girls are mediums and that mediums are required for communication with ghosts (Pimple 79). Spiritualist mediums are “sensitive to the presence of spirits and serve as a conduit for communication between his world and the other side” (79).

This prank led to the start of the mass movement of Spiritualism that influenced thousands of people in America and Britain, who took it, in a way, as their religion for the remainder of the nineteenth century, making people believe

that the living could communicate with the dead, which is the core of what Spiritualism is about - it is the science of communication with the dead (159). The movement arrived in England a year later, in 1849, a year after Crowe published her book, which showed “independence of thought and a clear feeling for the spiritual needs” (Heholt 25).

It was the séance phenomenon that led to the society’s continued belief in spirits and popularised Spiritualism even more (Lamont 898). One of the most prominent advocates of Spiritualism was Daniel Dunglas Home, who was the most famous medium of the Victorian era, conducting séances for the “British aristocracy and Continental royalty, for writers, artists, politicians, and scientists, as well as for the countless respectable professionals” (898). Consequently, it was difficult for the Victorians not to believe despite not being present themselves since such intellectual personas with social status were part of those séances (898). Among those influential individuals were Robert Owen the ‘Father of British Socialism;’ John Ruskin - a poet, art critic and famous essayist; Elizabeth Barrett Browning - a famous Victorian poet; Robert Chambers - a publisher; and many others, who were convinced and “unable to provide an alternative explanation for what they saw” (899). Even Queen Victoria “held a séance after Prince Albert’s death in hopes of contacting him” (Tromp 77). Coincidentally, Elizabeth Gaskell, who wrote numerous ghost stories herself, had a “half-believing, half-incredulous attitude towards the phenomena of spiritualism” (McCorristine 14).

The new idea of mobile spirits who willingly communicate with the living through mediums, with knocks and raps functioning as empirical evidence, was supported by a traditional belief in place-bound ghosts; “in other words, because

of the knockings, ‘belief’ moved from possible to probable to provable, and thus to ‘truth’” (Pimple 84). Nevertheless, Home remains a sort of enigma to this day since sceptics “have failed to explain adequately how he produced his phenomena” (Lamont 916) which challenged “both scientific and religious attitudes” (916).

Insight into Spiritualism provides a piece of valuable information on Victorian culture, especially the society’s beliefs and fears and mainly their relationship towards anything supernatural. The popularity of the séance phenomenon also helps to understand how they desperately wanted to connect with the spiritual world to ease their minds about the afterlife, which caused them anxiety in their time that was already full of uncertainties. Furthermore, Spiritualism provides an alluring point of view on life and its meaning that many find fascinating.

2 PART TWO

2.1 Eyes

Scott Brewster provides a critical point regarding Victorian ghost stories since he claims that the genre of "ghost stories are primarily a matter of vision, whether in terms of social visibility, theories of optics, or the relationship between the explained and unexplained supernatural" (Brewster 229). In this chapter, the main focus will be on eyes, gaze and vision, and their meanings, to understand those terms and their relevance to the ghost story. Overall, I intend to introduce theories by Lacan, Berkeley and Freud, to provide an understanding of gaze and vision.

I would like to start with a famous saying: "Eyes are the windows to the soul." One might believe that there is a potential connection between the eyes and the soul, that through one single glance, a person can see unspoken emotions and untold secrets or question the significance of someone else's lingering stare (Warren 543). However, eyes are not only "bodily organs with sensate functions, they are used as moral metaphors. We may be blind, or we may be 'blind to the truth'" (543). Vision, as one of the five senses, was put high on the hierarchy in the Western tradition over the centuries - the Greeks, in particular, "found the sight to be 'divine'" (545). Touch, taste and smell were considered lower in the hierarchy and attributed with words such as "animal, female and bodily," and seen as less significant, unlike sight and hearing, which were considered higher senses attributed to males and in Western philosophy to intellectual activities of writing, speaking, reading (545). In the nineteenth century, in particular, social philosophers gave a lot of meaning to eyes, such as believing Caucasian eyes

could reveal “social class, race and moral character” since they were convinced they were more privileged because they are oval, light, and wide unlike “close-set, small, dark, unreadable eyes,” which they attributed to “racially or criminally deviant” people of lower class (546). As one would expect, vision is a sense which could reveal our emotions and what our souls desire, but can also be “windows into the relationship of […] the social order” (554).

The issues of social class, race, what someone looks like, and how their eyes appear to reveal a certain characteristic are heavily present in *Wuthering Heights* with Heathcliff, which will be discussed later.

2.2 Gaze and Vision

The main concept of gaze is crucial not only for the understanding of seeing and observing, but the gaze is important from the narratology perspective for novels, such as ghost stories, with characters-narrators retelling the story to the readers. Beth Newman's "The Situation of the Looker-On” mentions Gerard Genette, literary theorist and structuralist, who reformulates the term ‘point-of-view’ by, for example, turning "on the distinction between a narrator who ‘speaks’ and a ‘focalizor’ who ‘sees’" (Newman 1029). Genette further elaborates that “such terms” suggest a gaze: “a look directed at the characters and acts represented by the subject(s) whose perceptions shape the story” (1029).

Having discussed this, during the nineteenth century, the way Victorian society understood sight was heavily influenced by science (Smajić “Ghost-Seers, Detectives, and Spiritualists” 5). One of the common claims was that whoever claimed to have seen a ghost moved from the visible facts to the

conclusion that they had seen *something*, which they assumed to be a ghost (Smajić "Ghost-Seers, Detectives, and Spiritualists" 5). From the 1840s onwards, that was a common thinking shared among Victorian epistemologists (Smajić "Ghost-Seers, Detectives, and Spiritualists" 5). The major theory that shaped the way Victorian society understood sight, was the theory of George Berkeley, who published his influential essay *An Essay Towards a New Theory of Vision* in 1709, in which he states that "the visible Eye, as well as all other visible Objects, hath been shewn to exist only in the Mind, which perceiving its own Ideas, and comparing them together, calls some *Pictures* in respect of others" (Berkeley 33). What Berkeley is suggesting with this argument is that there is no connection between what we see and touch (Smajić 6). Berkeley will then later develop it into the claim that the objects we perceive exist only in our minds as ideas we have of them (6). Therefore, our sight is why we are often misled into thinking about what shape or nature of an object we see, based on an optical theory that influenced nineteenth-century ghost story, in that matter (4). Importantly, what is compelling about seeing apparitions is not only the question of whether one should believe and trust their sight, but it also raises concerns about death and the afterlife, which are beyond our imagination (Smajić 4).

According to Smajić, "ghosts are examplars of things that look real enough but exist only in the deceived or deceived eye of the beholder," which is the thinking that influenced the ghost story in the nineteenth century (Smajić 4). George Henry Lewes, whom Smajić mentions in his work, argues that ghosts are not optical illusions, instead, he refers to them as a "product of erroneous inferences" (5).

What Victorian ghost stories have in common is the relationship between "vision and knowledge, seeing and believing" (17). This division is apparent if we shift the attention to the figure of a ghost seer (17). Smajić quotes an anonymous Victorian commentator, who remarks on the importance of seeing and believing by saying: "To believe in supernatural phenomena, a man must see them himself" (17). Implying that no matter what someone claims they have seen or experienced, it will not matter to a sceptic who has not experienced it or seen it with their own eyes because, based on common Victorian beliefs, vision is knowledge (17). In Smajić's other study: "The Trouble with Ghost-Seeing" (2003), he mentions the scholars Ermarth and Thomas, who also discuss the subjects of culture and vision in Victorian times and argue that the nineteenth-century literature, alongside realist fiction and detective stories, displays "signs of implicit faith in the epistemological value of sight and the universal legibility of visual signifiers" (Smajić "The Trouble" 1109). Again, the ghost story, as mentioned previously, follows the Victorian statement 'seeing is believing' and "the ideological dimensions of visuality in the nineteenth-century literature and culture" (1109).

What Smajić does is point out differences in the genres, when detectives in detective stories know what to look for while a ghost-seer typically experiences the dilemma of whether they should have faith in their sight with the knowledge that "vision is often deceptive and unreliable" (1109). Therefore, they decide to either have "ocularcentric faith" or be a sceptic (1109). This dilemma between faith and doubt "in the epistemological value of sight" is one of the reasons for the "emerging crisis in […] discourse on vision, a crisis shaped by two […] developments: the rapidly declining influence of theology and metaphysical

philosophy […] and the dissemination of ideas through physiological science about fundamentally subjective character of human vision" (1109 - 1110). Although physiological science could rationally explain the spectre as an "ephemeral image that exists nowhere except in the deceived eye of the beholder" (1110), those were precisely the arguments that led to more confusion and questions, typical for ghost stories, such as: Where is the line that distinguishes what is objective and subjective, what is still an optical fact and what is an optical illusion (1110)? On the contrary, the most crucial investigation regarding ghosts based on Catherine Crowe's study is empirical observation, which means gathering evidence or data through personal experience (1119). In Smajić's opinion, it is unreliable since ghosts can only be perceived with the so-called "intuitive inner sense," which does not need the help of the bodily organs, Crowe claims so herself, thus she contradicts herself in that matter (1119). She stood by the common Victorian mantra that *seeing is believing* (1120). To elaborate, Crowe values the importance of sensory observation. She is also aware there might be another way to perceive ghosts, such as the "intuitive inner sense," which is described as the power of the spiritual eye or ear that dwells in the spirit or soul, which functions the best when freed from bodily organs (1119). It provides a feeling of knowing and trusting that feeling without evidence or logical explanation, for example, feeling the presence of a ghost without even seeing it.

Finally, in science, an observer - a ghost seer who claimed to have seen a ghost that scientists perceived as a subjective optical effect - was labelled by them as "a subject suffering from a visual disorder or disease" (Smajić 18). It was common to associate "spectral delusions" with brain diseases, such as

insanity. Still, the Victorian scholar Ferriar maintains that even a healthy person can experience them because according to him, apparitions are fundamentally "occasional re-visions of things previously seen […] that have temporarily been brought back to life" (Smajić 1114). He goes on to explain that those impressions affect the visual nerves in precisely the same way they had in the past. Despite the observer having nothing present in front of their eyes, they still see *something* (1114). Notably, Sir Walter Scott, one of the most influential novelists and poets of Romanticism, followed the idea that if someone sees *something* in front of their eyes, it is caused by a disease. Scott published his study *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft* (1830) about the supernatural and witchcraft, which raises a question: "Who shall doubt that imagination, favoured by circumstances, has the power to summon up to the organ of sight, spectres which only exist in the mind of those by whom their apparition seems to be witnessed?" (Scott 13). Scott elaborates further by stating that it is a disease which presents "to the patient a set of spectres or appearances which have no actual existence" (22). In other words, eyes become "unreliable equipment" that does not function properly in certain situations (Smajić 1116). Walter Scott also disagreed with the widely spread belief that ghosts could be seen with the bodily eye only, especially since it meant the rise of religious doubt, which he opposed (1117). Furthermore, Scott argues that eyewitness accounts are the least reliable form of evidence, as the apparent ghost seer might change their story a little to appear more credible and intriguing (1125). The organ of sight in particular can be very easily deceived, so it is essential to be wary of such stories (1125).

The exploration of gaze and vision showcases how complex they are, and their study helps to discover their significance in various aspects, such as

narration, perception and perspectives. In ghost stories, the narration serves an important role in retelling the stories to readers. What makes the gaze intriguing is also the difference between the male gaze, often described as patriarchal, and the female gaze connected with a power men fear. Furthermore, in the Victorian era, the understanding of sight was heavily influenced by science, such as the theory by George Berkeley. Notably, ghost-seeing often leads to scepticism and dilemmas where many doubt the accuracy and reliability of sight.

2.2.1 Sigmund Freud

Freud was an influential figure and creative mind of psychology, who provided lessons to share his knowledge with his students on psychoanalysis as a former physician. In the medical field, psychoanalysis is a method of treating nervous patients by listening to their past and present experiences, complaints, confessions and emotions, among other things, while trying to understand them and provide a solution to their issues (Freud, "Introduction to Psychoanalysis" 6). It is also a theory of reading that suggests that what we read has more than one possible meaning, which we might not realise at first (Thurschwell 3). Thus this theory's goal is to go deeper "below the surface of the language of our everyday life," which doctors do with their patients' psyche instead of texts (3).

Since the chapter on ghost stories mentions how they are structured as dreams, I would like to provide a general understanding of dreams based on Freud's study, *The Interpretation of Dreams* (1899), which further focuses on the fulfilment of wishes. Freud uses dreams as a model "of all the disguised, substitutive, and fictive expressions of human wishing or desire" which invites us to analyse dreams "for the various relations between desire and language" since it is not the dream one needs to interpret but the "text of the dream

account" (Ricœur 5). In Freud's words: "Dream is not senseless, not absurd, does not presuppose that a part of our store ideas is dormant while another part begins to awaken" (Freud "Interpretations of Dreams" 103). He calls them valuable psychic phenomena that fulfil wishes; the process "takes place in the concatenation of the waking psychic actions which are intelligible to us" (Freud "Interpretations of Dreams" 103). Moreover, dreams can provide us with everything we desire and sometimes leave us thinking that we should have never dreamed about something like that, even in our wildest dreams, when they surpass our expectations in the real world (Freud "Interpretations of Dreams" 112). Even dreams that appear as nonsense hold some value, which signifies an "inner resistance to its interpretation" (Freud "Interpretations of Dreams" 116).

Further, Freud mentions recurring dreams, which he sees as punishment dreams, rather than wish-fulfilling (Freud "Interpretations of Dreams" 379). Regarding ghosts in ghost stories, they often appear because there is some unfinished business, something unresolved, from the past, which leads to those ghosts haunting the living, who might suffer because of that. However, they can also be interpreted as a manifestation of someone's desire, as they want someone deceased near them again. Both of these aspects are present in the analysed works.

2.2.1.1 Theory of Uncanny

To begin with, Freud was not the only one who studied the uncanny. It was also the German philosopher Friedrich Schelling and German psychiatrist Ernst Jentsch. In Freud's "The 'Uncanny'" (1919), he provides the depiction of the "uncanny," belonging to the category of terrifying, "which leads back to what is

known of old and long familiar" (Freud "The Uncanny" 220). Freud notes the uncanny is "undoubtedly related to what is terrible—to what arouses dread and horror" (Freud "The Uncanny" 219). However, the word is not always used in a sense that would be understandable in one meaning, which is why "it tends to coincide with what excites fear in general" (Freud "The Uncanny" 219).

For Freud, the word uncanny, or *unheimlich* (a German term), is in opposition to *heimlich,* which is possible to translate as 'homely', 'native', and 'familiar', which leads us to the simple conclusion that the reason why we frankly fear the "uncanny" is because it does not feel familiar, is strange or unknown (Freud "The Uncanny" 219). However, this definition is incomplete and misleading since not everything new or unknown is scary, according to Freud (Freud "The Uncanny" 220). In the German dictionary by The Grimm Brothers, the word *heimlich* is explained as "the sense of a place free from ghostly influences . . . familiar, friendly, intimate," which could also be referring to a haunted house since uncanny is associated with the domesticity home brings, or should bring instead of making us feel unsafe and anxious (Freud "The Uncanny" 225).

Freud continues by saying that "many people experience the feeling in the highest degree in relation to death and dead bodies, to the return of the dead, and to spirits and ghosts" (Freud "The Uncanny" 241). The reason is that "uncanny" is, in reality, not something new and unfamiliar but something familiar and old, which correlates with Schelling's definition and meaning of uncanny, which is "everything that ought to have remained secret and hidden but has come to light" (Freud "The Uncanny" 225). Smith notes that the "fundamental characteristic of the uncanny" is, thereafter, the return of the dead (Smith 14).

Specifically, he explains Freud's idea that the sense of uncanniness is caused by the perceived existence of spirits and ghosts (Smith 89). Furthermore, Freud brings out an uncanny effect that "is often and easily produced when the distinction between imagination and reality is effaced, as when something that we have hitherto regarded as imaginary appears before us in reality (Freud "The Uncanny" 244). However, even a living person can be considered uncanny, usually "when we ascribe evil intentions to him" and believe he has bad intentions (Freud "The Uncanny" 243).

Concerning the uncanny in literature, a different discussion based on Freud's study opens on this topic. Freud argued that in gothic texts, "it is much more fertile province than the uncanny in real life, for it contains the whole of the latter and something more besides, something that cannot be found in real life" (Freud "The Uncanny" 249). On this note, Smith elaborates, "the very unreality of the Gothic text becomes, paradoxically, the special place for the uncanny" (Smith 15). In terms of the uncanny in literature, it brings in the subject of the 'double,' which "has relevance for a consideration of the ghost story and the images of *the double,"* which is the living and the dead in those stories (Smith 94). On the topic of 'double,' Freud brings out the idea of repetition, which causes the feeling of uncanny. Why? In literature there might be characters appearing identical since "they look alike" (Freud "The Uncanny" 239). This also applies to characters having the same names or character traits through generations (Freud "The Uncanny" 234). In *Wuthering Heights*, for example, we have Catherine and her daughter, who look uncannily alike. Freud also connects the uncanny to repetition, referring to it as a 'compulsion to repeat,' which means reliving a traumatic experience (Freud "The Uncanny"

218). This is evident in “The Old Nurse’s Story” when the ghosts at the end of the story want to ‘relive’ the traumatic experience, with the remaining living tenants, that led to their death.

Finally, regarding sight specifically, Freud notes how the fear of blindness, losing sight or damaging our eyes is a fear we feel in our childhood that continues to adulthood, which is proved by a prevalent saying: “We will treasure a thing as the apple of our eye,” showcasing the importance of sight, our vision (Freud “The Uncanny” 231). Nicholas Royle points out that it is not surprising Freud associates uncanny feelings with strange sights and everything that “should have remained out of sight” (Royle 45). Although Freud does not focus on sight or gaze specifically in his study, it is clear that seeing is deeply associated with the uncanny, anything that threatens our vision (45). Sight, in general, is a crucial sense, which is evident by Freud’s mentions of “ghostly apparitions, dismembered limbs, the ‘evil eye’, the double and ‘*déjá* vu’,” which are “immediately associated with seeing” (45).

Overall, Freud approaches the uncanny “as a special shade of anxiety, which can be experienced in real life or […] literature, caused by the return of the repressed or by the apparent confirmation of surmounted, primitive beliefs” (Masschelein 54).

The Freudian theory is a “critically important attempt at understanding the psychological complexities which characterise the […] Gothic” (Smith 13). Further, it focuses on how the ‘uncanny’ brings a sense of unease and fear, feelings one should feel while reading a ghost story and ghost-seeing in general (6). Freud himself saw ghosts or strange figures as an example of ‘the uncanny’ (Hogle 6). Providing an overall description of the ‘uncanny’ that

awakens all those unpleasant feelings, can help with understanding why a particular gaze can evoke those feelings in characters encountering some sort of a ghost, or apparition.

2.2.2 Jacques Lacan

A key figure who focused on eyes and gaze is Jacques Lacan, a psychoanalyst and psychiatrist who published *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psycho-Analysis* (1978), in which he discusses gaze as well. In his work, Lacan reinterprets and draws on Freud's and phenomenologist Maurice Merleau-Ponty's work. Lacan interprets Merleau-Ponty's concept that there is something called a 'pre-existence of gaze,' which Lacan explains as follows: "I see only from one point, but in my existence, I am looked at from all sides" (Lacan 72). In other words, Lacan attributes the gaze to the anxious feeling of being watched by others. In ghost stories, it is common for the characters to experience the feeling of being watched and observed - be it by other characters or something supernatural. Victorian fiction critics often find Lacan's theories necessary for their work, especially his "splitting and fragmentation of the self-involved his formulation of the mirror scene, to investigate self-divided characters" (Jaffe 436). Critics also use Lacan's gaze theory to analyse male characters and their male gaze, "as a powerful device for constructing women as objects of masculine desire" (436). This criticism raises issues such as female characters being subjected to a masculine gaze; characters internalising this gaze, and how the narrative voices of specific novels align readers with a masculine view, inviting them to identify with its desire and appropriation structures (436). This issue is heavily present in *Wuthering Heights*, which will be discussed later.

To elaborate on the male and female gaze further, the male gaze or masculine vision is commonly described as "patriarchal, ideological, and phallocentric," implying that the connotations appear to have negative feelings, particularly toward women, who are frequently viewed as objects for men's pleasure only, which is mostly a feminist reading (Snow 30). The reason why women are made objects of the male gaze is for the men's "protection against being objectified themselves by […] female gaze" (220). In theory, the female gaze is often connected to the powerful gaze of Medusa, the icon of the female gaze as feminist reading would propose, who has the power to turn the onlookers to stone when they make eye contact with her (219). Susan R. Bowers suggests that patriarchal men have had to turn Medusa and women in general into objects of the male gaze to avoid being objectified by Medusa's female gaze themselves, which led to "the destruction of female subjectivity" since the men fear women's power (220). The female gaze or Medusa's eyes are described as being capable of perceiving "with an objectivity like that of nature itself […] They bore into the soul to find the truth" (230).

In terms of gaze and the feeling of visibility, Lacan introduces a so-called 'mirror stage,' which, in short, means when a child starts recognising themselves in the mirror, which is the world of the Imaginary (Bertens 134). When a child learns how to speak, they enter the Symbolic - the world of language that is "symbolised and represented by way of language" (134). Bertens further interprets Lacan's idea of the mirror stage as a confrontation with an image that the world gives us, however, this image is a distortion that results in a misrecognition of our identity (135). This concept is similar to one of the

possible translations and interpretations of Freud's 'uncanny' as something familiar that can bring us fear or anxiety when we encounter it.

For Lacan, a critical aspect is the recognition and response of 'others' or 'objects a'; other people who at first glance might appear like us but are also very different, who also influence our subjectivity with mutual interaction, so the 'Other'; which is an abstract observer that stands for social order and reality, can arrive as our identity (Bertens 135). This process turns us into subjects "since our identity is constituted in interaction with what is outside of us and reflects us" (135). The 'other' or 'object a' Lacan talks about in regards to the mirror phase is "precisely that part of the laws that one cannot see in the mirror, the part of the subject that has no mirror reflection," which is called the non-specular and it is what Lacan means by the Symbolic stage (Dolar 13). Moreover, what is interesting is the realisation that before comprehending our reflection, we were being observed by others and exposed to the gaze of other individuals everywhere at all times, similar to Freud's approach to the super-ego (Licintra Rosa 2). This idea brings in a quote by Jean-Paul Sartre, a French philosopher, who said: "When another person looks at me, his look may make me feel that I am an object, a thing in the midst of a world of things. If I feel that my free subjectivity has been paralysed" (Bowers 219).

To further elaborate on Lacan's mirror stage, what he aims at with this theory is to clarify "that one becomes endowed with an ego and establishes oneself as an 'I', only by one's mirror reflection" (Dolar 12). As stated above, the crucial point of Lacan's theory is the moment I recognise myself in the mirror, however, it is too late already for that because there is a so-called split, which makes it impossible to recognise myself and simultaneously be one with

myself (12). Dolar expounds on Lacan's theory by elaborating that: "With the recognition I have already lost one could call 'self-being,' that immediate coincidence with myself and my being and *jouissance"* (12). Lacan equates the word *jouissance* with pleasure caused by the double (13). The double Lacan describes causes trouble since it is the mirror image, including the 'object a', therefore, the imaginary starts to match with the real, causing anxiety since the double looks like me but also the 'object a', which is the invisible part recognised in my image (13). 'Object a' becomes part of the mirror image simply with a wink or a nod (13). Most fundamentally, the mirror, in this case, suggests a split, which Lacan often mentions, between the imaginary and the real and how "one can only have access to imaginary reality, to the world one can recognise oneself in and familiarise oneself with," despite the condition of losing the 'object a' (13). The loss of 'object a' helps to open objective reality that brings knowledge of this reality, but because the condition is that 'object a' needs to be lost, it cannot be an object of knowledge itself (13). In Lacan's view, the real cannot be dealt with directly; it emerges only from an oblique perspective, and attempting to grasp it directly causes it to fade away (21). The gaze is the best representation of the missing object because even though "one can see one's eyes" in the mirror, the gaze is the missing lost part (13). The double produces anxiety, which is the most reliable indicator of an object's appearance (13). Lacan describes it as "the lack lacking," which awakens the uncanny (13).

Sigmund Freud and Jacques Lacan are prominent figures concerning the gaze and the uncanny. Both of them suggest some unpleasant feeling in terms of being observed by others or seeing something familiar that brings fright or

discomfort when encountering something seemingly ordinary at first sight. Freud's study of dreams claims that they represent unconscious desires or wishes, which could also be said about the uncanny, and dream's structure is similar to the ghost stories. Lacan's gaze theory is crucial, not only because of the analysis of a male gaze but also for the analysis of the Other and his mirror stage, which causes the feeling of anxiety like the uncanny. In terms of gaze, Lacan proposes the discomfort of being watched by others, a common theme in ghost stories as well.

3 PART THREE

3.1 "The Old Nurse's Story" and *Wuthering Heights*

"The Old Nurse's Story," a typical, haunting short ghost story written by Elizabeth Gaskell, was first published in 1852 in Charles Dickens's Christmas edition of *Household Words,* a weekly magazine where Dickens was an editor (Martin 28), is understood to be Gaskell's only ghost story believed to be about actual events, which she also referred to as unexplained story in her letters to her friends (Martin 31). According to Martin, this ghost story helped Gaskell to prove her "skill as a raconteur" (32).

Gaskell wrote an eerie story of Hester, whom we meet as an older woman, who is recounting horrific incidents that happened when she was young while she was taking care of a wealthy family's daughter Rosamond, the mother of the children she is retelling the story to, which overall suggests a happy ending. The story takes place in an old mansion called Furnivall Manor House. Hester faces abnormal events in the manor in the form of scary noises and the supernatural, specifically ghosts of the previous family members who lived there. In short, the ghost story focuses on a family with a dark past that haunts them into the present, which readers learn through Hester and a character named Dorothy, "her friend and a fellow servant," who knows the place's history better than her (Martin 28). In that matter, "The Old Nurse's Story" is a world where the supernatural and the realistic intertwine, creating an atmosphere where people and ghosts coexist within the same space (28).

Unlike "The Old Nurse's Story," *Wuthering Heights* is not a typical ghost story but has a more complex plot. *Wuthering Heights* (1847) is a Victorian

novel by Emily Brontë, published under the pseudonym of Ellis Bell. Brontë's work is a masterpiece of 'realist' fiction. Despite "many peculiarities of circumstantial details," a reader is persuaded to believe that what they are about to read is "an accurate" depiction of the living life "in Yorkshire in the early nineteenth century" (Miller 362). What makes the novel even more intriguing is that it opens a debate for interpretations, for the reader believes there might be "some secret explanation" that helps them understand the novel as a whole (362). Since this thesis focuses on the role of gaze, Beth Newman made a point that *Wuthering Heights* "is a novel in which a narration is both foregrounded and linked repeatedly and emphatically to visual phenomena - in fact, to a gaze" (Newman 1030).

The novel follows the story of Heathcliff, who is taken into Wuthering Heights by Mr Earnshaw, who takes him in his care. Heathcliff grows close to Earnshaw's daughter Catherine, and their love story begins a tormented tale that leads to revenge and death. Thanks to its characters and their spiritual value, *Wuthering Heights* presents a spiritual world where ghosts are accepted as a common aspect of life, especially by those living near the Heights.

Gaskell's "The Old Nurse's Story" and Brontë's haunted novel are "strikingly reminiscent" of one another since in both works the ghosts "haunt the living" for they did something terrible, which the ghosts want to remind them about, among other similar aspects that will be discussed later (Kranzler 55).

3.2 The Uncanny

This subchapter will focus on one of the crucial aspects of gaze in ghost stories, the uncanny and the feelings evoked by the setting and atmosphere in the analysed stories. Examining the uncanny in this context helps to understand how

particular settings can be unpleasant, disturbing or causing discomfort and how those settings might influence or leave a lasting impression on people when encountered. However, the setting and atmosphere are not the only uncanny elements in the stories. Both works have uncanny characters that add to the overall atmosphere of the plots by embodying the uncanny themselves and leaving an impression on the other characters through their existence that feels familiar and strange.

3.2.1 The Uncanny: Setting and Atmosphere

The first look is on "The Old Nurse's Story," which has some uncanny elements, which the reader mostly learns through Hester's eyes. For instance, Hester sets the tone of the story at the beginning, as she provides her vivid depiction of the road and the house she will be newly occupying: "The road went up about two miles, and then we saw a great and stately house, with many trees close around it, so close that in some places their branches dragged against the walls when the wind blew; and some hung broken down; for no one seemed to take much charge of the place; to lop the wood or to keep the moss-covered carriage-way in order" (Gaskell 2). This description is not a typical example of the uncanny, where the familiar becomes unfamiliar and causes the feeling of horror, as one might assume. Nonetheless, it is crucial to remember that *heimlich* also means homely and friendly. Hester's description portrays a house that does not look welcoming, safe, or domestic. Instead, it seems Hester is about to enter a neglected haunted house isolated from the rest of the world, which creates an eerie atmosphere right from the start. Especially as she mentions: "The great forest trees had grown and overshadowed [the door] again" (2). Hester is also a

newcomer, so she is entering an unfamiliar house that once must have been grandiose until no one took care of it properly and left it be. Once inside, Hester shares that everything was grand, an "organ built into the wall" and passages and doors she never went through, so she cannot tell what lay inside, which not only creates a mysterious gothic atmosphere but also creates a foundation for the feeling of the uncanny, in the way how the details add to an eerie feeling because it leads to questions like what was behind those doors? Especially the giant organ, does it have a purpose? Not having enough answers creates an anxious feeling. Also, the organ could be read as a foreshadowing that something supernatural is lurking in the manor that will take place once the story progresses further since Hester puts such emphasis on it.

Later, some questions about the organ are answered, and it brings out another example of the uncanny that causes Hester to feel dread, as Freud argues is usual for the uncanny feeling, and brings the aspect of horror to life. Clueless Hester "was sometimes almost certain that [she] heard a noise as if someone was playing on the great organ in the hall" (Gaskell 4), which was the first indicator that "something is amiss in Furnival Manor House" (Martin 34). Mainly once she decides to ask other tenants, the staff, Dorothy and James, about the mysterious music she could sometimes hear in the evening, "booming and swelling away in the distance" (Gaskell 4). What raised her suspicion was James dismissing her and Dorothy, looking at James "very fearfully, and Agnes, the kitchen maid […] went quite white," and it was evident they did not like her question and were hiding something (4). Later, she learns about the tyrannical old Lord Furnivall, who haunts the manor and plays on the organ, which is the first ghost Hester becomes aware of, despite not believing it at first, thinking it is

Miss Furnivall playing and others are only making fun of her (Martin 34), only to find out the noise comes from an organ that is "all broken and destroyed inside," which is her first meeting with a supernatural that made her "flesh began to creep a little" (Gaskell 4). Even though Hester does not encounter an actual ghost in this scene yet, the situation of hearing music that she should not hear so loudly, especially from a broken organ, makes her question what is going on and makes her run and hide. It is the starting point of the mysterious events that will soon happen in the manor and later make her believe that ghosts exist.

Once Hester saw the ghosts with her own eyes, she was terrified, especially with the organ's sound resonating throughout the house, which made her feel "stunned" and "tremble" (Gaskell 7). Seeing ghosts is another example of the uncanny because, as mentioned earlier, Freud argued that the feeling of the uncanny is heavily experienced when encountering spirits or ghosts and when something "regarded as imaginary appears" as reality (Freud 244). However, the ghosts will be discussed later in more detail.

Despite *Wuthering Heights* not being a typical ghost story like "The Old Nurse's Story," it is still a gothic novel through and through with a creepy, gloomy setting and supernatural elements. Similar to the Furnivall manor, Wuthering Heights creates an eerie setting. Wuthering Heights, a dark manor with "narrow windows," is a place surrounded by moors, which suggests isolation from the ordinary world, as it is surrounded by unkept and wild nature and stands on the top of the hill, where the weather is unpleasant (Brontë 2). Mr Lockwood shares in his diary that the manor's location is "completely removed from the stir of society" (1). He also shares: "'Wuthering' being a significant provincial adjective, descriptive of the atmospheric tumult to which its station is

exposed in stormy weather. Pure, bracing ventilation they must have up there at all times, indeed" (2). Throughout the novel, it is evident that, like the Furnivall manor, Wuthering Heights is not a warm and homely place to stay. The place appears dark and mysterious and is true to its name, foreshadowing that Mr Lockwood will encounter some difficulties, as Hester, and that something eerie might happen.

The setting is not the only uncanny element found in the novel. It is crucial to mention Catherine's ghost, the ghost Lockwood encounters in the room, which also represents the uncanny, since Freud connects the feeling to spirits, as mentioned. Even the way that scene is described creates a perfect eerie atmosphere. Right before Lockwood goes to his room, he points out a "sorrowful sight […]: dark night coming down prematurely, and sky and hills mingled in one bitter whirl of wind and suffocating snow" (Brontë 15). In the room, in a sleepy state, Lockwood, instead of touching a branch disturbing his sleep, closed his fingers around "a little, ice-cold hand!" (28). And "the intense horror of nightmare came over" him (28). Once he saw Catherine's childlike face talking to him, he was maddened with fear (28). Lockwood even tried to sever Catherine's wrist by moving it against the wooden windowsill. In "The Uncanny" Freud mentions an example of losing limbs or a hand cut off by the wrist as an example of the uncanny and argues there is something peculiar about such images (Freud "The Uncanny" 244). The uncanny is mostly connected to death and the return of the dead that causes horror, which is the case in this scene as Lockwood sees a ghost for the first time. However, this scene will be discussed in more detail later.

3.2.1 The Uncanny: Characters

One of the uncanny resemblances in "The Old Nurse's Story" is the one between Rosamond and the ghost of the little girl referred to as a 'phantom child'. Hester learns that Maude Furnivall, the sister of Miss Furnivall, and her little daughter were banished into the cold weather by the old Lord Furnivall and were left to die there from the "cold and starvation in the snowy fells of Northumberland" (Kranzler 55). Maude wants to hurt Miss Rosamond by luring her to come and play with her and her child in the cold November weather, which she manages to do as Rosamond follows them, so Maude could make Rosamond another victim but fails to achieve that because, unlike in Maude's situation, Rosamond has people like Hester, who are looking after her and protecting her (Martin 35). Maude Furnivall is a lucid example of what Julia Briggs suggested about ghost stories - that the ghosts in Victorian ghost stories mainly seek vengeance if they were wronged in the past (Briggs 128). Rosamond and the 'phantom child' are both innocent victims because Maude got hurt by her father and sister, who did not stand up for her, which led to her and her child's death, and now Maude wants the same thing to happen to little Rosamond (Martin 35).

In *Wuthering Heights*, one of the most uncanny characters is also a child, Cathy Heathcliff, born Cathy Linton, the daughter of the original Catherine Earnshaw, who later became Catherine Linton after marrying Edgar Linton. Her daughter is described as "a second edition of her mother," whose fascinating "brilliant eyes" resemble those of her mother who died after giving birth to her and whose simple gaze torments the others because of how similar she is to her mother (Brontë 146). Cathy, called Cathy by her father to distinguish her from

her mother, has already stated that some men consider her gaze too powerful and fearsome because she is confident enough to stare back at them. It is not only her look and eyes that resemble her mother but also her personality. Even though she is not described as wicked like her mother, she is a curious child who runs wild like her mother used to. Thanks to Nelly's observations, it is evident that Cathy could not hide the expressions on her face and her eyes, especially once she met Hareton, as she "took a sly look at him" and showed admiration towards him immediately (Brontë 254).

Newman argues that Cathy's gaze "inscribes the dynamics involved in the gaze," which helps to illustrate a psychological aspect that once a woman looks back, she turns into a subject, leaving the position of an object, which the male gaze positions her into and "which defines her as a woman" (Newman 1032). Even more so when she demands Heathcliff to keep looking at her as he has nothing to fear: "I'll not take my eyes from your face till you look back at me! No, don't turn away! Do look! You'll see nothing to provoke you" (Brontë 321). Cathy is a spectator in this situation who positioned herself in the masculine role. But because she is a woman, her gaze is considered dangerous, and she is portrayed as a witch (Newman 1032). Cathy's gaze is powerful, and she is aware of that, and yet, she does not mind provoking the male tenants in the story with the fascination that lurks in her eyes (1033). In the end, Hareton is the one who returns Cathy's gaze to show his shared desire and feel joy, not fear (1036). Nelly points out that Hareton's eyes are similar, "almost alike" to Cathy's mother, Catherine Earnshaw, which brings out the idea of Hareton gazing at Cathy with female eyes, which is why he is not affected the same way as the other men (1038). Catherine's eyes, which the two children have, portray

how even after her death, she is heavily present, and the remainder of her existence tortures Heathcliff, which causes the uncanny effect, too.

Incidentally, Catherine's daughter is not the only person who uncannily represents someone from the past. *Wuthering Heights* is a work "that uncannily repeats, deforms, and exhumes its own earlier incarnations," which is portrayed in the generation that comes after the first one, when characters echo each other, such as Heathcliff and Hareton, or even Hindley, and Edgar with Linton Heathcliff, who are in a way "versions of each other," which creates an eerie and gothic atmosphere in the story when one realises the past is repeating itself with Catherine's ghost haunting them (Vine 358). The same can be said about the "The Old Nurse's Story."

When one thinks about the uncanny and remembers Freud's argument that we can call a person uncanny: "When we [can] ascribe evil intentions to him" and believe that they can achieve whatever bad intentions they have with some powers, this person in *Wuthering Heights* is Heathcliff, despite not having particular powers per se (Freud "The Uncanny" 243). Heathcliff is a complex character, constantly under scrutiny by the others who watch him and make judgements about him. Heathcliff is often observed and perceived by the narrators, Nelly and Lockwood. They share their opinions on him and what Heathcliff's gaze says about him, but they are not the only ones. The main narrators and other characters create a particular picture that is fascinating and intimidating to both the characters and readers since the readers are not provided with Heathcliff's point of view.

During Lockwood's first encounter with Heathcliff, he firstly perceives him as a warm person who "seemed more exaggeratedly reserved than myself"

but points out his suspicious “black eyes” (Brontë 1-2). From Nelly Dean, we learn how Heathcliff got into the Earnshaw family and how he did not fit in. Heathcliff was mistreated a lot, which led to his departure from the Heights for some time and his desire for revenge, and he became an even worse person than he was before. Regarding the definition of the ‘uncanny’, Heathcliff comes back as someone familiar; he looks the same but has changed into an unpredictable person who causes anxiety and brings uncertainty to other characters who never know what he will do next or what to expect, which can be considered uncanny. Perhaps they did not expect him to return, and suddenly, Heathcliff emerges like a ghost from the past. Heathcliff’s more vile and cruel behaviour and his toying with the other characters to get what he wants heighten the uncanniness and evoke a sense of mystery about him. He is like an alien disrupting their ordinary lives.

In the novel, Heathcliff is often described as some supernatural being, non-human, something animalistic rather than a living person, which adds to the uncanniness surrounding him. One of those moments is when Nelly describes his eyes as “basilisk eyes” that were “quenched” by exhaustion, and “his lips devoid of their ferocious sneer” turned into a sad expression (208). Furthermore, when she wants to make sure Catherine has not fainted and is alright, “he gnashed at [her], and foamed like a mad dog, and gathered Catherine to him with greedy jealousy. [Nelly] did not feel as if [she was] in the company of a creature of [her] own species” (187), pointing out yet another animalistic anomaly, making him seem as a supernatural being like an “evil beast,” rather than a human with feelings and a place to be, to belong (124). Even Catherine refers to him as an “unreclaimed creature” and a “wolfish man” (118). This is

even more evident when Isabella, in her letter, asks Nelly: “Is Mr. Heathcliff a man? If so, is he mad? And if not, is he a devil?” (Brontë 159). When Isabella calls Heathcliff a monster, Nelly stands out for him, even though the reason for that has more to do with her stance on the supernatural rather than feeling sympathy towards him. However, even Nelly later once again wonders: “Is he a ghoul or a vampire?” But refrains from thinking further because she “watched him grow,” so she knows he cannot be anything other than human (386). She wonders where the “little dark thing” came from, but “dawn restored [her] to common sense” (387). Heathcliff embodies “unhuman agency in every aspect of his being,” be it the “dubious circumstances of his birth” or “his disruptive insertion into a family on through to his animalistic, devilish, and monstrous appearance as an object of superstition,” especially to Nelly Dean once he grows up, and becomes an adult (Cottom 1080).

In regards to Heathcliff’s eyes or intense gaze, they are mainly connected to darkness or negative feelings, in contrast to Isabella’s blue eyes, which Catherine describes as “dove’s eyes - angel’s,” which he would gladly turn black with his prominent and dominant personality, especially since her eyes resemble those of Edgar whom he hates, making it clear that his darkness would spoil her and destroy her were she to spend more time with him, which would hurt Edgar too (123). What can be understood by this is the essential power Freud mentions regarding uncanny people with bad intentions. It is evident that Heathcliff has bad intentions; he wants to destroy those who wronged him no matter what, and even though he does not have superpowers, he is aware that his personality is cruel enough to hurt the sweetest soul like Isabella’s.

The last thing to mention about Heathcliff is his peculiar death at the end, which scared Nelly. When he passes away, Nelly finds him on Catherine's bed. She remembers, "His eyes met mine so keen and fierce, I startled, and then he seemed to smile" (393). Newman points out that Heathcliff dies with a gaze "so intense that it makes his death mask an affront" (Newman 1038). What is intended by that is that he should not die with such a powerful, unsettling expression charged with such meaning because he is dead and therefore, should not look so happy and alive. Nelly further continues: "I tried to close his eyes: to extinguish, if possible, that frightful, life-like gaze of exultation before anyone else beheld it. They would not shut" (Brontë 393). Newman argues that the dead are not meant to look back at us unless they want to take us with them and make us one of them (Newman 1038). The image of the dead Heathcliff with his eyes open is eerie because it blurs the line between life and death. After all, he seems alive, but he is not. Freud argues that the feeling of uncanny is experienced in the "highest degree in relation to death," so it is possible that the feeling Nelly felt was uncanny (Freud 241). Interestingly enough, Heathcliff dies with such a happy expression because he has no doubt he will reunite with Catherine, his other half. This will be discussed in more detail later in the subchapter focusing on Lacan's Other.

3.3 Seeing Is Believing: Ghosts and Visual Proof

A crucial aspect of ghost stories where the gaze is necessary is the actual ghost-seeing and how much one can trust their sight. "The Old Nurse's Story" and *Wuthering Heights,* as mentioned, are intertwined by the supernatural and superstition and have their ghosts from the past that come to haunt the present

over unresolved issues. In this subchapter, I will delve into the ghosts in those stories and their visual proof, and if the seeing confirms the existence of ghosts for the characters and whether they become believers who trust their sight. In both stories, we have houses invaded by ghosts who haunt the living. The ghosts make themselves visible and interact with the living tenants of the houses.

3.3.1 Old Lord Furnivall, Maude Furnivall And the 'Phantom Child'

In "The Old Nurse's Story," more than one ghost is present in the ghostly tale. In Victorian ghost stories, ghosts communicate with the living by showing themselves or making themselves heard, as was discussed in the theoretical part. Hester's first encounter with the supernatural is through noise. She keeps hearing loud music from the organ, thinking Miss Furnivall is playing, only to find out the organ is destroyed inside, as discussed. Despite Hester learning about the old Lord Furnivall, she is not yet convinced the music was made by a ghost since she did not see him with her own eyes and does not take it as evidence that ghosts could be real, even though it left her terrified.

The prominent ghosts of the story that convince Hester about their existence are Maude and her child, the 'phantom child.' The 'phantom child' or a 'spectre child' is first seen by Rosamond, and when Rosamond tells Hester about the child, Hester does not believe her and accuses Rosamond of lying. Hester is convinced it was Rosamond's fever-talking, as it was common during the Victorian era, and even before, to associate someone who believed to be seeing ghosts with illness or mental issues. Hester makes the point that only Rosamond's footsteps were in the snow, no one else's, so her story does not

make sense (Gaskell 6). Once again, there was no visual evidence for Hester to believe what Rosamond was saying. Hester is a sceptic throughout the plot until she sees the child herself, proving the words of Smajić, that based on Victorian beliefs, the vision was knowledge (Smajić "Ghost-Seers, Detectives, and Spiritualists" 17). Without proper empirical evidence, which Hester could see herself, Rosamond's explanation of why she wondered outside in such cold weather made no sense and was unbelievable (17). Once Hester catches sight of the phantom child crying and "beating against the window panes as if she wanted to be let in" herself, there is no denying it, and she becomes a believer (7). However, all the tenants were aware of the phantoms lurking around the Furnivall manor, which made Hester feel "very uneasy" and afraid (7). The main reason is Hester trying to protect Rosamond from the phantom child, only to be reminded by the housekeeper Dorothy that she has no right to "take Miss Rosamond with [her], for that she was [hers] lord's ward, and [she] had no right over her" (Gaskell 8). Dorothy went even further by making the already frightened Hester question: "Would I leave the child that I was so fond of, just for sounds and sights that could do me no harm; and that they had all had to get used to in their turns?" (Gaskell 8). Suggesting that everyone apart from Hester was aware of the manor's haunting history, and no one tried to warn her and protect her and little Rosamond. The tenants were used to the ghosts and accepted them, despite suffering, however, Hester, as a newcomer who had no idea, was mortified.

In the end, Hester is made aware of the existence of the old Lord Furnivall, who appears physically in the story. Lord Furnivall haunts the house to punish his daughter Maude and her child for simply existing and tormenting

them. He disapproved of Maude's relationship with an unknown musician and keeping that man's child. "The power of both the living and the dead […] strikes fear not only in Hester but in the rest of the household as well" (Martin 34). After becoming a ghost, old Lord Furnivall's gaze has not changed because even after death, he oozes pride, control over others and cruelty with his piercing "gleaming eyes" making others scared to death with his gaze (Gaskell 10). Miss Furnivall, despite her fear, communicates with her dead father to save not only Miss Rosamond but also the phantom child from his cruelty by screaming: "Oh, father! Spare the little, innocent child" (10). She did not stand up for her sister and her child at the time but did now. Shockingly, right after, another "phantom shape itself, and grow clear out of the blue and misty light that filled the hall" (10). Hester describes it as "very beautiful to look upon, with a soft, white hat drawn down over the proud brows, and a red and curling lip. It was dressed in an open robe of blue satin" (10). Hester realised it was the ghost of the younger version of Miss Furnivall, who coldly gazed at the scene and after a few moments, disappeared. At that moment, Miss Furnivall's old body was "stricken down by palsy-death" with the other phantoms gone. It can be interpreted as if the 'curse' was gone, and they disappeared for good because Miss Furnivall finally dared to face them and speak up to her father.

When the tenants with Hester took Miss Furnivall to bed, Miss Furnivall kept repeating: "What is done in youth can never be undone in age!" over and over again until her death the next day (11). Miss Furnivall is haunted by her mistake of telling her father about her sister, who had a child with the dark musician, as she is jealous because they love the same man. Miss Furnivall knows she cannot change it and must live with the guilt. It is interesting to note

that all of this happened during cold winter weather, specifically New Year's Day, suggesting that the phantoms only appeared and haunted the manor during the winter season, which was fatal to them in the past as if they were stuck in a loop, but not anymore.

In the end, there is no doubt about the events happening. Hester was a witness, alongside the other tenants, who saw all the ghosts together in the room without Hester sharing any doubts but rather accepting them and believing her own eyes that vividly saw "the terrible phantoms moved on, regardless of old Miss Furnivall's wild entreaty, and the uplifted crutch fell on the right shoulder of the little child" as the dim lights and fire went out (Gaskell 10). Moreover, before everyone even saw all the phantoms gathered in the east wing, Hester shared that she and Mrs Stark: "too, heard voices and screams, and no longer heard the winter's wind that raged abroad" (10). By the time the story ends, it is clear that Hester changes from being a sceptic to a believer because of the visual evidence of the ghosts.

3.3.2 The Ghost(s) of Wuthering Heights

One of the most prominent ghosts in Wuthering Heights appears in the petrifying scene where Lockwood encounters Catherine Earnshaw's ghost in the window of her old room, which affects not only Lockwood but others too, especially Heathcliff since she left such a mark and was an influence on others. Like Hester, Lockwood is a newcomer who knows little about the place's history, particularly concerning the ghosts who in this story also do not leave the earth and haunt the living, but unlike in "The Old Nurse's Story," the haunting of Catherine is welcomed, mainly in Heathcliff's case.

When Lockwood was led by Zillah to a room to stay the night, he had no idea what was awaiting him. “While leading the way upstairs, she recommended that I should hide the candle, and not make a noise; for” Heathcliff did not allow anyone to stay in that room (Brontë 21). Inside, he found a ledge covered with scratches that said Catherine Earnshaw, Catherine Heathcliff, and Catherine Linton all over it (21). He slept for a minimum of five minutes when he noticed a “glare of white letters started from the dark, as vivid as spectres - and the air swarded with Catherine’s” (21). It was a notebook belonging to Catherine, which spiked his interest. When he was in the middle of reading it, he began to nod and fell asleep with a dream. In that dream, which quickly escalates into a realistic nightmare, he hears the wind and the rapping sounds of branches, which he tries to stop, but instead of a branch, his fingers wrap around an ice-cold hand. Then he hears a noise yelling: “Let me in!” And that she is Catherine Linton, who has been lost in the moors for twenty years (21).

When he sees her child’s face, Lockwood tries to get rid of her hold by trying to sever her hand at the wrist against the pane, which is a part that shocked Victorian readers for its savagery (Downing 362). Downing interprets this scene as ambiguous because it is not evident if an actual ghost appeared to Lockwood or if he cut himself since there is blood on the sheets (362). This would be an example of an “uncanny effect” that Freud defines as being “produced when the distinction between imagination and reality is effaced” (Freud “The Uncanny” 244). Lockwood first explains it to Heathcliff from the imaginary point of view when it is over: "I had the misfortune to scream in my sleep, owing to a frightful nightmare” (Brontë 29). Heathcliff gets upset that Lockwood disturbed his night with that screaming and tells him that the only

excuse would be if his throat is being cut (29). On that matter, he's defending himself as if "a literal body had been outside" (Downing 362): "If the little fiend had got in at the window, she probably would have strangled me!" (Brontë 30). Notably, Lockwood blames the reading of Catherine's name for his strange experience, which could have influenced his psyche and therefore he dreamt about her (Downing 362). "Reading results in uncanny repetition of the read," which Brontë "makes literal through" the first dream, where Lockwood sees the white letters (362). What Lockwood sees swarming are the individual letters C-A-T-H-E-R-I-N-E, and then it is the actual literalised Catherine (362). Downing refers to Lockwood's dreams as an "unintentional reworking of inscriptions" that he came across in the room and read (362). Once Lockwood makes it clear what has happened, he becomes a witness to Heathcliff's "frantic calling out" for Catherine (Miller 364) in an "uncontrollable passion of tears" (Brontë 31): "Come in! come in!' […] 'Cathy, do come. Oh, do—once more! Oh! my heart's darling! hear me this time, Catherine, at last," which Lockwood sees as "a piece of superstition" (31).

Heathcliff's reaction is interesting because he makes it seem as if it was not the first time Catherine showed up at the window. Even Zillah brings Lockwood to that room to see if it is haunted, wanting to confirm the place's supernatural history. Lockwood is not convinced at first that it is all real and perceives Catherine's ghost as a dream, unlike Heathcliff, who desperately wants it to be true (Krebs 44). Even as Catherine passed away, Heathcliff screamed: "I know that ghosts have wandered on earth. Be with me always—take any form—drive me mad! Only do not leave me in this abyss, where I cannot find you! Oh, God! It is unutterable! I cannot live without my life! I cannot live without my

soul!" (Brontë 194, 195). Heathcliff's desperation could also be prompted by his asking Catherine to haunt him and her telling him before her death that she will not rest peacefully until he is with her in her grave (147). Heathcliff appears as a spiritualist since he has a strong stand on ghosts being real and is convinced that death is not the end and he can see Catherine again.

Edgar R. Shannon, Jr. argues that the dream Lockwood had dreamt was also caused by the atmosphere and mood of the place, the Heights, that produced it (Shannon, Jr. 97). For instance Mrs Heathcliff's, Catherine's daughter, taunting of Joseph and her progress in the Black Art, claiming how the "red cow didn't die by chance" (Brontë 16) making it sound like she had something to do with it, or eventually Zillah telling Lockwood while leading him to that room that "they had so many queer goings on" (21), could all influence Lockwood's dreams (Shannon, Jr. 97). Not only that, but it should also be noted Lockwood went to bed exhausted from the dog attack, snowfall, and nose-bleed, which led to Zillah pouring cold water on him, so he was also freezing, so to no one's surprise, he felt tired from all that suffering that made him fall asleep so quickly, which he says were the "effects of bad tea and bad temper!" (Brontë 25). His dream's content is, "though immediately induced by his reading and the rapping branch, emotionally derive[d] from the events of the past two days" (Shannon, Jr. 98).

What is striking to note though according to Krebs that it cannot be a dream simply because the ghost in the window shares information Lockwood is not yet aware of, such as Catherine being dead for twenty years and also being lost on the moors, even the fact she was calling herself Catherine Linton, not Earnshaw, even though he "had read Earnshaw twenty times for Linton"

suggesting he should have naturally remembered that name more and dream of it over Linton (Brontë 30). Thus, the "dream contains information to which the dreamer could have had no access," Krebs claims he cannot consider it a simple dream (Krebs 46). Lockwood, as an outsider, needs someone like Nelly, who knows the history better to make sense of this episode (46). Catherine's ghost is up to interpretation, however, Krebs's arguments provide good enough reasons for the reader to believe that the incident was not a nightmare and that Lockwood had encountered a real ghost. Heathcliff's reaction and Zillah's evident need to gather evidence that Catherine is haunting the Heights should be convincing enough for Lockwood. After his incident with Catherine's ghost, it appears that Lockwood is, after all, persuaded about the existence of ghosts and rejects the idea that the child-like Catherine in the window was only a dream, as he says to Heathcliff: "Swarming with ghosts and goblins: you have a reason in shutting it up, I assure you," after the encounter (Brontë 29).

Towards the end, despite not seeing anything herself, Nelly believes that Heathcliff communicates with spirits, mainly Catherine, whose name she hears him say. During the scene where he is essentially on his deathbed, she watches him gazing:

> at something within two yards' distance. And whatever it was, it communicated, apparently, both pleasure and pain in exquisite extremes: at least the anguished, yet raptured, expression of his countenance suggested that idea. The fancied object was not fixed, either: his eyes pursued it with unwearied diligence, and, even in speaking to me, were never weaned away. (Brontë 388)

It is possible that this was merely a hallucination, given Heathcliff's poor health and impending death. However, due to his strong belief in ghosts and the afterlife, he convinced Nelly, who had not witnessed anything and never considered herself a believer, that he had communicated with someone, possibly Catherine, who was awaiting him.

Despite *Wuthering Heights* being a complex and chaotic novel, the story concludes with a peaceful ending with Catherine and Heathcliff's ghosts "quietly wandering the moors" together, therefore, Lockwood and the readers are "left with the vision of walking ghosts" showcasing how the ghosts are not ready to be "laid to rest" yet (McKinstry 145-146). The people around the Heights believe in supernatural beings and perceive them as a common aspect of life that does not phase them. This acceptance is apparent at the end of the novel, where Nelly shares the sightings of Heathcliff and even Catherine by his side: "The country folks, if you ask them, would swear on the Bible that [Heathcliff] walks: there are those who speak to having met him near the church, and on the moor, and even within this house. […] That old man by the kitchen fire affirms he has seen [Catherine and Heathcliff] looking out of his chamber window on every rainy night since his death" (Brontë 394).

Both "The Old Nurse's Story" and *Wuthering Heights* provide a great understanding of *seeing is believing*. In both cases, we have ghosts who are haunting a mansion and who make themselves known by making a sound and visibly appearing to the living. Moreover, both works have characters like Hester and Lockwood, who have no idea about the haunting history of the places, and they are terrified at first before accepting ghosts as a part of life. Importantly, Hester and Lockwood are sceptics before seeing the ghosts with their own eyes.

It is more evident with Hester, who refuses to accept any talks about spirits until they appear right in front of her, making it impossible to deny their existence. Heathcliff also represents a spiritualist, for he is vocal about believing ghosts are real and wishes to be haunted by his true love Catherine, because he knows it is possible. When reading the novel, it is evident Heathcliff has his reasons for believing in ghosts even before Lockwood shows up in the Heights.

Overall, “The Old Nurse’s Story” and *Wuthering Heights* prove that people tend to be sceptics until they encounter ghosts and have no reason to doubt their sight, then they turn into believers.

3.4 Narration

As far as gaze goes in ghost stories, the observer/narrator of the events plays one of the most important roles. Through the eyes of the person who witnessed the events, the story is revealed, and readers are made aware of the supernatural aspect of the tale. The narrators play a pivotal role in forming an engaging tale by revealing those uncanny, unsettling moments and establishing an atmosphere through their perspectives and attention to detail through their gaze, some of which were already discussed. In this section, I will address the significance of the three main observers in the ghost stories that have been analysed: Hester, Nelly Dean, and Mr Lockwood and how their gaze showcases their perspectives on others.

3.4.1 Hester

In "The Old Nurse's Story," Hester, the first-person narrator, plays the roles of both eyewitness and survivor of the terrifying incidents that occurred while she was a young nurse-maid and not even an adult. Despite being distant

in both space and time, she is an important character in the retrospective narration of the story since she narrates it from a different perspective and as an older lady than the events occurred (34).

To understand Hester better, she is a young, dependent girl whose primary role in the story is to look after little Miss Rosamond and protect her once the supernatural beings become interested in the little girl later (34). The young Hester does not have enough power to protect the girl against the supernatural threats, however, Hester tries her absolute best to protect Miss Rosamond with the love she feels towards her, showcasing deep affection for Miss Rosamond at such a young age (34). Her determination to protect Rosamond is strong as she constantly watches the little girl with her caring gaze (34).

As discussed, Hester, as the narrator of a typical ghost story, provides an excellent depiction of the uncanny and the ghosts that appear in the tale, which she retells to the children of Miss Rosamond. Hester starts the story with: “You know, my dears, that your mother was an orphan and an only child” - which adds to the credibility of the ghost story as a real story (Gaskell 1). However, Hester is a precise observer of others, not only the supernatural and the uncanny. Hester proves herself to be a narrator of high quality through her ability to pay attention to details in her descriptions of the setting of the place, the manor, and the characters she encounters, which makes the story more believable. For example, she shares: "We had left all signs of a town, or even a village, and were then inside the gates of a large, wild park - […] with rocks, and the noise of running water, and gnarled thorn-trees, and old oaks, all white and peeled with age,” portraying a particular landscape, so the reader can imagine what kind of setting and atmosphere to expect from the story (Gaskell 2).

Furthermore, Hester is a great observer of the other characters when interacting with them. Her descriptions of characters provide her perception of what kind of people they are, which also reveals her gaze and attitudes, such as her portrayal of the old Miss Furnivall, who was “thin and tall, and had a face as full of fine wrinkles as if they had been drawn all over it with a needle's point” and who “looked so cold, and grey, and stony as if she had never loved or cared for anyone (2),” which is in contrast to the woman of “a great beauty” she once was when she was young and referred to as Miss Grace, as Hester learnt through the beautiful portrait painting (Armitt 63). As mentioned, Miss Furnivall is stuck in the past where she had a feud over a man with her now dead sister Maude, who ended up being her “rival,” which could be the reason why this long-suffering and guilt especially, took their toll on her and life disappeared from her eyes, turning her into a cold woman with an even colder gaze, who appeared not to feel anything anymore (63). Carol A. Martin describes her situation as “a long life of hopelessness” (Martin 34).

Miss Furnivall is not the only character Hester describes as someone whose youth is long gone, and the past events took their toll on them. She depicts Miss Furnivall alongside Mrs Stark, a servant, as: “I knew no good could be about them, with their grey hard faces, and their dreamy eyes, looking back into the ghastly years that were gone” but she still felt “kind of pity” towards Miss Furnivall at least (Gaskell 9). Overall, Hester, as a woman, feels sympathy towards the Furnivall sisters once she learns their story. Despite them not being blameless, their story is perceived by Hester as them being relatively innocent and victims in comparison to the wicked and cruel old Lord and the unknown musician the sisters fought over, despite their father’s displeasure, which is

"suggested by the attitude of [Hester as narrator] and by the parallel that exists between the Furnivall sisters on the one hand […] and the child Rosamond […] and the phantom child, on the other" (Martin 34). As pointed out, the similarity is that the phantom child, seeing young Rosamond with Hester at her side, wishes to re-enact the situation with Maude, who was betrayed by her sister and forced to leave with her helpless child, the cousin of little Rosamond, and die, to make Rosamond another victim. Moreover, both the sisters and the children were innocent and victims of the cruelty of Lord Furnivall, who had started it all (34).

From the way Hester starts the story, it is apparent she is about to reveal a story she was part of when she was young, immediately making the story engaging. She is a female narrator with cognitive ability as she pays attention to details, be it the setting or the characters she encounters and observes with her gaze that often focuses on the eeriness of the place and the beauty or the power of time evident in people's faces reflected in their eyes as well.

3.4.2 Nelly Dean

Wuthering Heights' most prominent narrator/observer is also a female, Nelly Dean. Critics may regard her as a plot device, but I see her as one of the story's primary characters. She is a servant, an eyewitness, who can provide a personal remembrance because she lived there and witnessed the crucial events firsthand, exactly like Hester. Similarly to Hester, she is an observer who shares her opinions and perceptions of others, in Nelly's case, it is mainly Heathcliff, who she constantly watches. Newman sees Nelly as a "vigilant watcher" and a looker with a "controlling gaze" (Newman 1034). She further elaborates that one

of her key roles is the role of a supervisor, more specifically, watching over and protecting Catherine, which she has in common with Hester, who was looking after little Rosamond (1035). Thus, Catherine is the one who is the most aware of Nelly's gaze since she is supervising her under Edgar's orders, who does not want her interacting with Heathcliff (1035). The same happens with Catherine's daughter, Cathy, whom Nelly must supervise as her father wishes, but ineffectively. Also, as a woman, her role as an observer and narrator is different because as she shares the "reflected image" of Catherine with Lockwood, she observes "on behalf of men while seeking to remain outside the circuit of desire" (1035).

Nelly Dean gets the help of Mr Lockwood when narrating the story. The two provide different points of view in the framing narrative of the novel. Lockwood shares with the readers his encounter with the strange "family" who live in "isolation" in Wuthering Heights (Shunami 449). Nelly Dean is in charge of the "inner story," and retells to Lockwood "the history of the two families during the last two generations" (449). Nelly has been part of the household for eighteen years already. She was there when Heathcliff and Catherine were just kids and even followed Catherine to Trushcross Grange when she married Edgar Linton, as she was going back and forth between the two houses (Goldfarb 53).

Nelly does not tell her story while she is living it but does so for the first time with Mr Lockwood, who is intrigued to hear about the history of Wuthering Heights. "After decades of keeping her story to herself, she has one chance with a captive bedridden audience to tell that whole, to get it right" (Sternlieb 14). Likewise, Hester shares it for the first time with the children when she is much

older. “Stranger and intimate combine to certify the general facts” while sharing their observations and perceptions of the other characters (Woodring 299).

Firstly, I want to discuss Nelly Dean's cognitive abilities as a narrator, which make her credible. Nelly has a great memory and is an expert at paying attention to details and obtaining information even when she is not part of some moments. As a servant, she is present and can easily gain information. Nelly makes an “excellent spy, an excellent policing agent” for the Earnshaw and Linton families, and she does it so well that no one suspects anything, especially Catherine and Cathy (Newman 1035). Lockwood, or the reader, learns the events thanks to her “direct testimony of her eyes and ears,” getting confessions out of other characters since they trust her, especially Catherine, who, for example, confesses to Nelly her devotion to Heathcliff and doubts about her marriage to Edgar (Shunami 452). She is also able to gain information from receiving letters (452). The most notable letter Nelly receives is from Isabella, who tells her that her life in Wuthering Heights with Heathcliff, whom she married, is dreadful and that she is unhappy, adding an important and necessary piece to the plot. Nelly also gains information from eavesdropping and being a nosy woman, which she is (452). Nelly even admits to Lockwood that sometimes she “only speak[s] from hearsay” (Brontë 229).

Regarding Nelly’s credibility, I will explain why she could be considered credible. One of the reasons for her credibility is her approach to supernatural events. Nelly could be read as a credible narrator thanks to her sceptic approach to supernatural phenomena (450). Once, she claims: “I believe the dead are at peace: but it is not right to speak of them with levity,” confirming her beliefs and religious stance (Brontë 395). Like other scholars, Woodring also claims Nelly’s

credibility lies in her superstition because he finds her “superstitious enough to foreshadow with presentiments, she is sceptic enough to acknowledge her superstition” (Woodring 303). She never truly admits to her “belief in spirits,” however, she is aware that the “country folks” as she refers to them, who live around the Heights, openly admit without shame to believe in ghosts and claim to see them wandering around and she accepts that (44). Nelly remains trustworthy and a “canny witness” when she recounts what she has seen and observed because she is uncertain about “the supernaturalness of the characters and events,” which ironically are convincingly supernatural (Woodring 303). On an interesting note, Charlotte Brontë's editing and preface to the book, which she wrote for the reissue following her sister's death, is largely responsible for the perception of Nelly Dean as a trustworthy narrator in general (Shunami 451). In the preface, Charlotte Brontë writes that Nelly is “a specimen of true benevolence and homely fidelity” and demonstrates a character that is constant and full of tenderness, and therefore, should not be doubted (Drew 367). Nelly differs from Lockwood even in her oral language, which she uses to share her memories of the events, such as “really, you know, sire” or “well, Mr Lockwood,” which Woodring accepts as a sign of her credibility because it is a contrast to Lockwood’s prose narrating (Woodring 302).

Yet, Nelly Dean has her own interests and is occasionally biased because she has strong feelings about the people involved, especially regarding her employers. One of the things that might question Nelly Dean’s ability to retell the events objectively is her desire to “gain control over” Wuthering Heights and Trushcross Grange, which she could only get after getting rid of Heathcliff and her belief she was in control over Cathy too (Shunami 451). That being said,

Nelly “distorts the paper of events,” so she can “justify her decisions and actions” to the oblivious Lockwood, who takes her words at high value from the very beginning (451).

Nelly Dean, as a narrator, is very observant, watchful and attentive. Thus, it adds to the eerie feeling because she watches the other characters constantly, and nothing gets past her. Nelly shares with Lockwood how she was “determined to watch [Heathcliff’s] movements,” and she did so (Brontë 124). As a narrator, she behaves as a judge of the other characters since she perceives them in a certain way (Woodring 302). For in her eyes, Heathcliff is a “brute beast,” “evil beast,” or a “black villain” she detests. Heathcliff is not the only one she judges. She pronounces Cathy a “wild, wicked slip” who “meant no harm” but should be “chastened into humility” (302). However, she also showed a slight sympathy towards Heathcliff when she was “weeping as much for him as her” when Catherine dies because she sees him praying, which she describes as “his lips moved and his gaze was bent on the ground” till he tried to defy her sympathy with an “unflinching, ferocious stare” (Brontë 193).

Overall, Nelly Dean is very involved as a narrator, and her gaze is necessary for the plot. Nothing escapes her as a servant. If she misses out on important information, she has her ways of obtaining the missing piece of information, including letters and gossip. Moreover, she is a good storyteller who “reveals the character of others” (Woodring 304). What might question her credibility or reliability as a narrator is that she inserts her own emotions and beliefs into her narration, like her religion and being a sceptic about the supernatural, which depicts the story in a way she finds fitting based on her standards. However, even though she favours others, Catherine over Heathcliff

is the most evident example, she can be critical even towards Catherine and find sympathy for Heathcliff.

3.4.3 Lockwood

Alongside Nelly Dean, the other prominent narrator is Mr Lockwood. He is an outsider like Hester, unlike Nelly Dean, unaware of the history of the place as he attempts to make sense of everything unusual that Nelly Dean tells him. He has a lot of intriguing and "confusing data" that he has to piece together to come up with a "coherent pattern" (Miller 43). Lockwood as a narrator is the one who speaks directly to the readers through his diary, reporting what he has learned from Nelly Dean, Heathcliff and Catherine Earnshaw's diary (Wiltshire 113). He shares with the reader what Nelly Dean tells him, which makes him an essential narrator. He says: "I'll continue it in [Nelly's] own words, only a little condensed. She is, on the whole, a very fair narrator, and I don't think I could improve her style" (Brontë 181). In contrast to the previous female narrators, he provides a different perspective as a male narrator when he does not record what Nelly Dean told him in his diary, which is the main aspect I will focus on.

On the whole, Lockwood is an educated man. Melissa Fegan rightfully describes him as a distinguished character who is still a quite young gentleman, "well-off," and a typical guy from the city (Fegan 23). When he arrives at the Heights, he immediately expresses his unease and discomfort in the presence of the tenants. Especially when he realises there is some tension among them. For example, Hereton who claims Lockwood disrespected him. Lockwood then shares: "He fixed his eye on me longer than I cared to return the stare, for fear I might be tempted either to box his ears or render my hilarity audible," and it

made him feel out of place, even the “spiritual atmosphere” of the place (Brontë 15). Nonetheless, Lockwood, as an outsider who does not know the history, calls his position “the situation of the looker-on” (69).

As previously stated, *Wuthering Heights* is linked to the visual phenomenon of a gaze, as Newman suggested. A key incident in Lockwood's narration, where he recalls a memory of spending time at the sea coast, appears soon at the start, revealing more about him. In the following passage, Lockwood describes meeting a gorgeous woman, whom he was instantly captivated by, so he kept staring at her. That woman gazed back at him, probably flirting as she assumed he was interested. It scared Lockwood to the point of having to look away and the woman to doubt his intentions, missing a possible relationship. In Lockwood’s recollection of that memory, he shares:

> I was thrown into the company of a most fascinating creature, a real goddess in my eyes, as long as she took no notice of me. […] If looks have language, the merest idiot might have guessed I was over head and ears: she understood me at last and looked a return - the sweetest of all imaginable looks. And what did I do? I confess it with shame - shrunk icily into myself […] At every glance retired colder and farther; till, finally, the poor innocent was led to doubt her senses. (Brontë 4)

This quotation perfectly illustrates how men approach the feminine gaze. Lockwood is intimidated and no longer enjoys looking at the woman after his stare is caught and she looks back (Newman 1030). As a man, the woman’s female gaze “filled him with fear” (1030), which is how the female gaze is commonly seen and was mentioned in the chapter focusing on gaze. He finds the woman *fascinating* to substantiate her charm (1030). Newman points out that the

word originates from *fascinum,* which means witchcraft, which correlates with the current "meaning of *fascinate - 'to bewitch,'*" which is still present in the definition to this day, which explains the meaning of the words as follows: "to transit and hold spellbound by an irresistible power" (1030). In Lockwood's failed flirtation, he suggests that his gazing at the woman is common. In contrast, a woman who returns her gaze to a man is considered threatening, making him lose control of himself and feel overwhelmed and intimidated by her stare, paralysing him (1030). This situation recalls Freud's 'Medusa's Head,' whose direct look turns man into stone, turning them powerless with the loss of dominance. Medusa's gaze that men fear can be interpreted as an intimidating "sight of someone else's look," meaning that "the knowledge that the other sees and therefore resists being reduced to an appropriable object" (1030). In other words, men have the privilege of looking at women and perceiving them as objects "(of representation, discourse, desire, etc.)" (1030). Moreover, such resistance is undoubtedly unnerving, as it disrupts "the male subject's" enjoyment of gazing "and the hierarchical relations" that allow him to establish his authority and dominance (1030). Thus, it is unsurprising that with her every glance at Lockwood, he shrinks into himself with shame, clearly fearing the female gaze and not liking being "the spectacle instead of spectator," when moments ago he was enjoying looking at her unnoticed, leaving him feeling emasculated, as Freud would put it (1030).

Another instance of Lockwood's male gaze is his observation of Catherine Heathcliff, another woman who does not shy from staring back, as was mentioned in the subchapter focusing on the uncanny characters. In his description, he points out:

> Her position before was sheltered from the light; now, I had a distinct view of her whole figure and countenance. She was slender, and apparently scarcely past girlhood: an admirable form, and the most exquisite little face that I have ever had the pleasure of beholding; small features, very fair; flaxen ringlets, or rather golden, hanging loose on her delicate neck. (Brontë 10)

His telling of the story makes it clear that he considers Catherine a gorgeous young lady he enjoys gazing at. Regardless of finding her attractive, he is ambivalent about her eyes when he says: “Had they been agreeable in expression, that would have been irresistible” and that her eyes are filled with “scorn and a kind of desperation“ too (10). He feels this way because, as the first beautiful woman, Catherine too, is a “looker,” someone who is not ashamed to stare back, therefore, she “disrupts” his enjoyment of gazing at her with pleasure (Newman 1032). He shares his displeasure by stating: “She never opened her mouth. I stared—she stared also: at any rate, she kept her eyes on me in a cool, regardless manner, exceedingly embarrassing and disagreeable” (Brontë 9). He is upset that she did not acknowledge his gaze the way he demanded and instead stared at him provocatively (Newman 1032), which is why it is not surprising Lockwood later calls her a “little witch” with “beautiful eyes” (Brontë 17). This agrees with Newman’s mention of the origin of the word *fascinating*, being *bewitched*. Yet, Catherine Heathcliff has the same effect on other men in the novel, not just Lockwood. For instance, Heathcliff tells her, "What fiend possesses you to stare back at me, continually, with those infernal eyes?" (Brontë 372). Ironically, Cathy’s eyes “are precisely similar, and they are those of Catherine Earnshaw” (Brontë 377), which could be why Heathcliff struggles

with her daughter's gaze because he sees her mother, whom he still loves deeply. Those examples showcase the power of the female gaze and how men are intimidated when a woman removes herself from the position of an object and stares back as the spectator (Newman 1032). Lockwood's interest in the young Catherine is what brings him to ask Nelly about the history of the place, hoping it will "satisfy his desire for Catherine and cure him," as well as help him to be able to protect himself from "the power of her gaze" (1033).

Lockwood is an intriguing narrator. He comes to a foreign place surrounded by strange individuals and becomes fascinated by the young Catherine as he notices her beauty. Overall, Lockwood's narration is a great example of a masculine gaze because he is intimidated by women who are not shy to stare back and make eye contact, making him feel less like a man.

3.5 Lacanian Reading

In this subchapter, I would like to delve into another essential role of gaze that is evident in *Wuthering Heights* specifically, as the novel provides more information, depth and insight into the complexity of the characters, which are not present in "The Old Nurse's Story" as a short ghost story. In this part, I would like to focus on Lacan's psychology, mainly the otherness of characters alongside the mirror stage as Catherine identifies herself in Heathcliff and likewise. To understand their deep connection, I will mention their gaze and how their eyes reveal their emotions and feelings for one another.

Still, I want to briefly describe a possible Lacanian character in "The Old Nurse's Story", Miss Maude Furnivall. When she was alive, we learn that Maude fell in love, went behind her father's back, married a musician and gave birth to a daughter. In doing so, she disgraced the head of the family, her father, by not

listening to him, doing whatever she wanted against his wishes and breaking social rules, leading to him disowning her and casting her away from the house with Maude's daughter. Suddenly, Maude was treated as an outcast who had no family to support her and her child. Her life choices led her to become an Other since she was cast away and did not belong anywhere anymore, a typical feature of otherness that is more evident with the character Heathcliff.

Heathcliff, an uncanny character, embodies Lacan's Other in all its regards. His background is unknown, and he emerges into the Heights as an outsider who is rejected. Heathcliff is described as a "dark-skinned gipsy in aspect," who looks like a gentleman because of the way he dresses and his mannerisms and who has "an erect and handsome figure" but is "morose" (4). In this sense, Lockwood points out a particular conflict regarding Heathcliff because of his foreign features, which were the cause of his not being welcomed by the Earnshaw family in the first place since he is not familiar but foreign. Heathcliff disrupts the Heights with his presence. Steven Vine argues that one of the aspects of the Other that Heathcliff possesses is that he lacks "a knowledgable origin" among other things, since he is brought into the house by Mr Earnshaw without even having a name and being an orphan before Mr Earnshaw decides to give him a home and name him, so his origins are unknown (Vine 341). He "comes from outside," therefore "from the other," which causes his inability to belong in a particular "social place" or remain stable in any place (341).

Most of the novel's characters view Heathcliff as an outsider, even a monster, portraying him with an animalistic nature and pointing out his otherness, as mentioned in the subchapter focusing on Heathcliff as an uncanny character. For instance, Isabella, his wife, often describes him as: "a lying fiend! A monster,

and not a human being!" because of his actions and treatment of others. Ironically, Lockwood also refers to Catherine's ghost as a fiend (Brontë 176).

Heathcliff is an unsettling marvel and other characters try to place him into the categories they know (Sonstroem 55). Nonetheless, Mr Earnshaw is the one who instantly likes Heathcliff and idealises him. Moreover, "he took to Heathcliff strangely, believing all he said" (42). Vine explains this statement as a demonstration of "Heathcliff's liminal position at the Heights as both other to and part of its affective structures" since he is the son of Earnshaw but also is not, he belongs to Heights but also does not belong there - he fulfils Earnshaw's desires "and exceeds that desire as an unincorporated other" (344). Vine argues that Heathcliff excels at mirroring the behaviour of those who wrong him, becoming "a grim parody" of those he "supplants" by providing them with "an ironic image of their own repressed significance" as he repeats and exaggerates the characteristics of characters he "outs," such as defeating while also mirroring Hindley's violence as he takes over the Heights (Vine 342).

Like the previous analysis based on Lacanian theory, Sonstroem focuses on Heathcliff's look because one of the visible aspects of Heathcliff is his intense gaze and a specific look in his eyes. As mentioned in the theoretical part, eyes not only reveal emotions and desires but it was understood that eyes reveal what type of person someone is and what social class they belong to. If their eyes were dark, that person was believed to belong to a lower class. Since Heathcliff is portrayed as a man with darker features, it is not surprising that the tenants of the Heights treat him as a foreigner and someone who is not good enough.

Sonstroem observes that in *Wuthering Heights*, "how one feels is related to how one sees" (Sonstroem 52). Heathcliff's eyes are unforgettable, according to

Nelly, who says his “deep-set” eyes that show “no lights from within” are to be “remembered” (Brontë 107). Since eyes are believed to showcase people’s true emotions that cannot be hidden, Heathcliff is a true example of that saying. The novel frequently shows how he tries to hide and control his emotions but fails since his eyes reveal those feelings. To illustrate, on Catherine’s dying bed, even Heathcliff says to her: “Kiss me again and don’t let me see your eyes” (186). He cannot fathom seeing the look in her eyes, which would reveal her emotions that would affect him, and it would be hard seeing the life leaving her eyes since he loves her deeply, so he would rather not make eye contact with her. It demonstrates even danger to him because it could cause his own emotions to betray him, which is why he believes it is safer not to make eye contact. Sonstroem points out a general impulse of people, which is to “ignore someone or something disagreeable by averting one’s eyes,” which is what Heathcliff is doing in this particular scene to avoid seeing her sick face that was causing him agony (Sonstroem 52).

As mentioned previously, Heathcliff dies with his eyes open and looks happy, according to Nelly, who is mortified by their eye contact. However, she does not have to fear his gaze. Heathcliff’s returning gaze suggests “a dangerous identification with the other,” which is the dead Catherine in this case, who he believes is awaiting him (1038). Nelly has nothing to fear because his gaze is not directed at her as an “earthly being” that could return her gaze to him. It is directed at the dead, more specifically Catherine Earnshaw’s ghost, whom he desperately believed to be seeing and feeling her spectral presence before his death and his last couple of days; he “has long solicited” her gaze, and that is why he looks joyous on his death bed (1038). Nelly shared that he had a

“strange joyful glitter in his eyes” (Brontë 383). It was considered a bad omen if a corpse was being prepared for burial and still had its eyes opened, which is why Newman mentions Heathcliff’s open eyes in her article as something important to focus on (Newman 1041). Newman also suggests that Heathcliff is desperate to complete himself with his missing part, Catherine, so he can “restore a primary loss for which the gaze of another functions as a part object,” which Lacan calls the ‘other’ or ‘object a’, “something the subject contours as a piece of what has been lost from the self” (1038). Heathcliff’s passion, obsession with and devotion to Catherine is why he died in peace. He did not feel peace from the day he lost her, as her death left him feeling empty, and death was the only solution for him to reunite with his other half. In this case, the female gaze is desired and not feared because it provides Heathcliff with “the possibility of lost wholeness,” which is Catherine for him as the lack he was lacking all this time, the object of his desire that was taken from him by another man and then death (1038). Interestingly enough, Catherine also dies while smiling. All of this is intertwined with the mirror stage and identifying with the other as Heathcliff seeks Catherine’s existence, even in the afterlife, to feel whole, and Catherine sees herself in Heathcliff, and likewise. Heathcliff identification with Catherine can be seen in this quote: “I cannot live without my life! I cannot live without my soul!” (Brontë 195). Life and soul being Catherine for him.

To emphasise their deep connection, Catherine’s gaze provides a look into what kind of character she is, especially regarding her duality. Because she gazes at the world differently according to who she is with, Heathcliff or Edgar. Her eyes, like those of Heathcliff's, show her emotions and her deep connection to him. As mentioned, Catherine embodies the Lacanian mirror stage in that matter.

The Lacanian mirror stage, which is intertwined with similarities to the uncanny, is the last crucial aspect of the gaze, which appears in *Wuthering Heights*, that I will analyse.

Nelly shares with Lockwood that when Catherine was a child, she constantly tested their patience since she was up to any "mischief" (Brontë 46). Catherine's "spirits were always at high-water mark, her tongue always going-singing, laughing. [She was] a wild, wicked slip [with] the bonniest eye, the sweetest smile," and the biggest punishment for her was if they kept her apart from Heathcliff whom she was very fond of (46). Later Catherine proclaims, that she is Heathcliff, he is her "own being" and says the most famous quote from the novel: "Whatever our souls are made of, his and mine are the same," unlike hers and Linton's, whose soul is "as different as a moonbeam from lightning, or frost from fire.'" (93, 95). For that reason, Catherine's identification of herself as Heathcliff showcases her true feelings where she believes she and Heathcliff are the same; they make each other whole, they seek one another, and only with him is she being her true self, not with her husband Edgar, who made her gaze at the world differently (Cottom 1083). Catherine chooses to marry Edgar for social position. She decides to give up a romantic love because the Lintons showed her what life she could have and what she could be, and the belittling of Heathcliff caused her to view Heathcliff differently, which led to her struggle with her emotions and identity (Stoneman 522). Before Catherine met the Lintons, she was free-spirited, wild and happy with Heathcliff by her side, which was enough, afterwards, her gaze changed. Catherine's daughter, who behaves similarly to her mother, changes from a wild to a more reserved girl due to her isolation at the Heights, until she befriends Hareton and starts teaching him,

which gives her a new purpose and makes her happy and more like herself again. Unlike her mother, Cathy ends up with her love in the living world. Catherine's feelings towards Heathcliff changed abruptly and she began to see him as not good enough and even considered him dirty. The same Catherine who fixed her eyes on Heathcliff and refused to avert her eyes worried that he would vanish if she looked elsewhere upon his return. Even after marrying Edgar, her eyes flashed with eagerness when awaiting Heathcliff (Brontë 111, 183). Her identification with Heathcliff is crucial because of the Lacanian theory of the mirror stage too. Lacan proposed that the mirror stage occurs when an infant recognises themselves in a mirror. Stoneman points out that Catherine and Heathcliff's relationship, especially at the beginning of the novel when Catherine finally had someone by her side who understood and accepted her wild side, who did not want her to change, is a reflection of Lacan's mirror stage, "in which all children look for a confirmation of their own identity in a mirror-image of themselves, found metaphorically in the answering gaze of the mother, or of another child, a brother or sister," which in this case is Heathcliff who she identifies with (Stoneman 523). Macovski argues that Catherine represents the child who wants to clarify her selfhood with a focus on the other whom she identifies with (Macovski 374).

Heathcliff and Catherine's desperate desire for wholeness began when they were children. Together they rebelled against Hindley, mocked Joseph, and connected with the natural world while understanding one another, and lacking the same connection with anybody else. They only had each other and this connection could not be replaced with anyone when they became adults, not Isabella and Edgar could complete them. Catherine felt Edgar could also be the

one for her, but he lacked Heathcliff's otherness and ended up being too different from Catherine. Heathcliff and Catherine only needed each other to live. Stevenson points out that the natural world is important for Heathcliff and Catherine as it is emphasised by the sighting of their ghosts wandering in the moors at the end of the novel, which brought them closer as children and is all they need (Stevenson 65).

Newman suggests a different example of the mirror stage. In the novel, dying and starved Catherine sees herself in the mirror, and gets shocked by her reflection. “The returning look from the place of the other disrupts her” (Newman 1031). It is fascinating that even the way both Catherine and Heathcliff leave the world is the same, as Heathcliff mirrors Catherine and starves, potentially wanting to feel what Catherine felt as she starved herself; Heathcliff is described as looking ghastly pale with hollow cheeks and blood-shot eyes, definitely not like himself, and dies in a bed with the window opened, believing Catherine is awaiting him (Brontë 390). On Catherine’s deathbed, Nelly shares that Catherine's eyes looked “dreamy and melancholy,” soft and appeared to no longer gaze at things around her but her “distant and vague” eyes were gazing beyond without showing recognition towards things (182-183). So it should not be surprising that in her state of “delirium,” she fails to recognise herself in the mirror despite Nelly convincing her it is her image (1040), which ends up being a “source of uncanny horror” that haunts her since she believes that thing in the mirror is a ghost and the room to be haunted (Stoneman 531). “She loses her identity as Catherine Linton,” comments Vine, who suggests that Catherine in this scene became an ‘other’ to herself (Vine 355). Newman argues that this scene could be read as Catherine not being an object of any male gaze,

Edgar's or Heathcliff's, not "even her own" (Newman 1040). And it comes with a price, because as she sees her reflection in the mirror unseen by them as their object of desire, "she loses her sense of self and identity" in the process and realises that "she has been the object of Nelly's gaze," who does not see "her as an object of desire," since Heathcliff left. Her husband creates a distance between them, so she feels unwanted and unseen towards the end of her life (1040).

The otherness, or the Other, and Lacan's mirror stage are a crucial part of *Wuthering Heights*, especially. Heathcliff is a typical example of the outcast, who is not welcomed in society and is under constant scrutiny for being different and, therefore, not fitting in. Catherine is the one he constantly seeks out to feel complete, even if it means marrying someone else, to only feel closer to her and get revenge. Heathcliff and Catherine need each other's otherness to function and live. They identify with and mirror each other, portraying their strong bond in that sense. If not Heathcliff and Catherine's words or actions, their eyes reveal honest emotions to confirm that bond. Catherine's dual gaze shows how she gazes at the world differently, with Heathcliff or Edgar, but later realises about her identity that Heathcliff is "more [herself] than [she is]" (Brontë 93).

4 Conclusion

My thesis examined the various roles of gaze that may occur in ghost stories, including the role of the uncanny, actual ghost-seeing leading to *seeing is believing*, observers in the form of narrators, and, finally, the Lacanian otherness and the mirror stage. Now, I would like to share my observations and conclusions.

As a typical ghost story, "The Old Nurse's Story" portrays the existence of classic ghosts, whose purpose is to punish and get revenge on people, with other common aspects of a ghost story. Through Hester's eyes, the story progresses through its gothic atmosphere in the Furnivall Manor House, where suspicious things keep happening, and the ghosts haunt the living tenants because of the past. Gaskell managed to create a ghost story that is captivating and scary, with hints of mystery and uncanny. The role of the gaze is important in this tale. For one, Hester's keen eye helps readers to understand the other characters better and unravel the mysteries in the house. Secondly, she proves people are sceptical about anything supernatural without empirical evidence. Fundamentally, "The Old Nurse's Story" is a great ghost story that evokes the feeling of reality rather than fiction, thanks to the character of Hester and her detailed observations.

The other analysed literary work was *Wuthering Heights*. As a realist novel with a ghost episode and talks about the supernatural, the book portrays more types of gaze than a typical ghost story. But it remains true to its title of a gothic novel since even in Brontë's novel, we have the living and the dead communicating with one another. In Nelly Dean, a servant, we find an observer who constantly watches the characters and is present when everything happens

in the Heights and Grange. Like Hester, she does not believe in ghosts; unlike her, she never changes her mind about them since she has never seen any herself. She admits she knows people who believe in them, like the country folks or a desperate Heathcliff and eventually Lockwood. Nelly Dean is the source of the uncanny in the novel as she shares what she has seen, especially of Heathcliff, who has done some questionable things that made her portray him as a beast and not a human being. Lockwood, as an outsider, gets interested in the history of the place, mainly because of young Cathy, Catherine's daughter, who catches his eye. He observes her with his male gaze and feels uncomfortable when she returns his gaze and does not shy away. Lockwood portrays women staring back as threatening for his (and other men's) manhood and therefore depicting women according to the stereotypical male gaze.

The gaze of Heathcliff and Catherine holds significant importance as they are perceived differently: Heathcliff is viewed as inhuman, whereas Catherine is admired for her beauty and viewed mainly positively. Despite this, they both consider themselves the same, representing the Lacanian mirror stage. In addition, Heathcliff and Catherine are Others who struggle in the story. Heathcliff suffers because of the mistreatment of the other characters, while Catherine's struggles are the result of her own decisions. Moreover, they both create an uncanny effect, Heathcliff when he returns and makes everyone uncomfortable with his behaviour and Catherine when she gives birth to a daughter who resembles her. In addition, Heathcliff is part of Catherine's identity, she is not whole without him, and they are seeking the other to feel whole again. Catherine declares they are the same, and the same can be said

about Heathcliff, who longs for her as his other half to feel complete as one soul, portraying the intensity of their love.

The main ghost of the story is Catherine, who decides to return home to the Heights after twenty years, which illustrates different approaches to ghost-seeing. For example, Lockwood initially believes it was a dream but ultimately acknowledges Catherine's spirit as a real ghost. In contrast, Heathcliff, despite not seeing Catherine's ghost himself, believes Lockwood immediately and knows that Catherine's ghost appeared by the window of her old room because of his deep love for her. Later, Nelly, as an observer, interprets his belief of seeing Catherine as an effect of his delirium and being close to death since she did not see anything herself as a sane person.

Despite the novel not being a typical ghost story that only focuses on ghosts, the story is intertwined with superstition, talks of ghosts and the uncanny and Others where the gaze plays a crucial role.

Lastly, in both works, we have the uncanny, observers retelling the events, and the confirmation of the Victorian mantra of *seeing is believing*, as the characters need visual proof to believe that ghosts exist to accept their existence. The only character who does not believe in ghosts is Nelly Dean, who has not seen any herself in particular. Both works demonstrate that ghost stories can provide more than ghosts and witnesses of the supernatural to make a good ghost story. There is so much more to focus on regarding the gaze that makes those stories whole and popular, be it the setting; mistreated outsider; eyes revealing true emotions or characters mirroring each other.

WORKS CITED

Berkeley, George. *An Essay Towards A New Theory Of Vision*. Fourth ed., 1732.

Bertens, Johannes Willem. *Literary Theory: The Basics*. London, Routledge, 2014.

Brewster, Scott, and Catherine Spooner. "The Genesis of the Victorian Ghost Story." *The Cambridge History of the Gothic*. Ed. Dale Townshend and Angela Wright. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2020. Pp. 224–245.

Cadwallader, Jen. "Spirit Photography Victorian Culture of Mourning." *Modern Language Studies*, vol. 37, no. 2, 2008, pp. 8–31. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/40346959. Accessed 13 Mar. 2024.

Cottom, Daniel. "I Think; Therefore, I Am Heathcliff." *ELH*, vol. 70, no. 4, 2003, pp. 1067–88. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/30029913. Accessed 20 May 2024.

Chapin, David. "The Fox Sisters and the Performance of Mystery." *New York History*, vol. 81, no. 2, 2000, pp. 157–88. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/23182334. Accessed 29 Jan. 2024.

Dolar, Mladen. "'I Shall Be with You on Your Wedding-Night': Lacan and the Uncanny." *October*, vol. 58, 1991, pp. 5–23. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/778795. Accessed 21 Mar. 2024.

Downing, Crystal. "Unheimliche Heights: The (En) Gendering of Brontë Sources." *Texas Studies in Literature and Language*, vol. 40, no. 3, 1998, pp. 347–69. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/40755267. Accessed 12 May 2024.

Drew, Philip. “Charlotte Brontë as a Critic of Wuthering Heights.” *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol. 18, no. 4, 1964, pp. 365–81. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/2932731. Accessed 5 July 2024.

Fegan, Mellisa. *Wuthering Heights: Character Studies*. Continuum, 2008.

Freeman, Nick. “The Victorian Ghost Story.” Edinburg University Press, 2012, pp. 93-107.

Freud, Sigmund. *Introduction to Psychoanalysis*. Germany, Books on Demand, 2018**.**

Freud, Sigmund. The ‘Uncanny’. *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, Volume XVII (1917-1919): An Infantile Neurosis and Other Works*, pp. 217-256.

Freud, Sigmund. *Interpretation of Dreams*. Edited by Janet B. Kopito, Third ed., The Macmillan Company, 1913.

Goldfarb, Russell M. “The Survival of Nelly Dean in ‘Wuthering Heights.’” *CEA Critic*, vol. 51, no. 4, 1989, pp. 53–63. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/44377566. Accessed 12 May 2024.

Goulimari, Pelagia. *Literary Criticism and Theory*. Routledge, 2015.

Heholt, Ruth. “Speaking of Seeing Ghosts: Visions of the Supernatural in the Tales of Catherine Crowe.” *Ghosts - or the (Nearly) Invisible: Spectral Phenomena in Literature and the Media*, edited by Maria Fleischhack and Elmar Schenkel, 2016, pp. 25–34. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctv2t4d7f.6. Accessed 29 Jan. 2024.

Imfeld, Zoe Lehmann. *The Victorian Ghost Story and Theology from Le Fanu to James*. Springer International Publishing, 2018.

Jacobs, N. M. "Gender and Layered Narrative in 'Wuthering Heights' and 'The Tenant of Wildfell Hall.'" *The Journal of Narrative Technique*, vol. 16, no. 3, 1986, pp. 204–19. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/30225153. Accessed 12 May 2024.

Kranzler, Laura. "Gothic Themes in Elizabeth Gaskell's Fiction." *The Gaskell Society Journal*, vol. 20, 2006, pp. 47–59. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/45185907. Accessed 12 May 2024.

Krebs, Paula M. "Folklore, Fear, and the Feminine: Ghosts and Old Wives' Tales in 'Wuthering Heights.'" *Victorian Literature and Culture*, vol. 26, no. 1, 1998, pp. 41–52. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/25058402. Accessed 12 May 2024.

Lacan, Jacques. "The Split Between the Eyes and the Gaze." *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis*. 1973, pp. 67-78.

Lamont, Peter. "Spiritualism and a Mid-Victorian Crisis of Evidence." *The Historical Journal*, vol. 47, no. 4, 2004, pp. 897–920. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/4091661. Accessed 29 Jan. 2024.

Licintra Rosa, Carmelo. "From the Imaginary to Theory of the Gaze in Lacan." *Frontiers in Psychology*, vol. 12. 2021.

Macovski, Michael S. "Wuthering Heights and the Rhetoric of Interpretation." *ELH*, vol. 54, no. 2, 1987, pp. 363–84. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/2873028. Accessed 22 May 2024.

Martin, Carol A. “Gaskell’s Ghosts: Truths In Disguise.” *Studies in the Novel*, vol. 21, no. 1, 1989, pp. 27–40. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/29532616. Accessed 28 June 2024.

Masschelein, Anneleen. “The Concept as Ghost: Conceptualization of the Uncanny in Late Twentieth-Century Theory.” *Mosaic: An Interdisciplinary Critical Journal*, vol. 35, no. 1, 2002, pp. 53–68. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/44029938. Accessed 7 Mar. 2024.

Mathison, John K. “Nelly Dean and the Power of ‘Wuthering Heights.’” *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol. 11, no. 2, 1956, pp. 106–29. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/3044112. Accessed 12 May 2024.

McKinstry, Susan Jaret. “Desire’s Dreams: Power and Passion in ‘Wuthering Heights.’” *College Literature*, vol. 12, no. 2, 1985, pp. 141–46. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/25111656. Accessed 8 May 2024.

Miller, J. Hills. “Wuthering Heights: Repetition and the ‘Uncanny.’” *Fiction and Repetition: Seven English Novels*. 1982, pp. 42-72.

Oppenheim, Janet. *The Other World: Spiritualism Ans Psychical Research in England, 1850-1914*. Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Pimple, Kenneth D. “Ghosts, Spirits, and Scholars: The Origins of Modern Spiritualism.” *Out Of The Ordinary: Folklore and the Supernatural*, edited by Barbara Walker, University Press of Colorado, 1995, pp. 75–89. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctt46nwn8.10. Accessed 10 Apr. 2024.

Ricœur, Paul. *Freud and Philosophy: An Essay on Interpretation*. Translated by Denise Savage, Yale University Press, 1970.

Royle, Nicholas. *The Uncanny*. Manchester University Press, 2003.

Scott, Walter, and Henry Morley. *Letters on Demonology and Witchcraft*. Third ed., George Routledge and Sons, 1884.

Shannon, Edgar F. "Lockwood's Dreams and the Exegesis of Wuthering Heights." *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol. 14, no. 2, 1959, pp. 95–109. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/3044162. Accessed 12 May 2024.

Shunami, Gideon. "The Unreliable Narrator in Wuthering Heights." *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol. 27, no. 4, 1973, pp. 449–68. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/2933519. Accessed 12 May 2024.

Smajić, Srdjan. *Ghost-Seers, Detectives, and Spiritualists: Theories of Vision in Victorian Literature and Science*. Cambridge Univ. Press, 2013.

Smajic, Srdjan. "The Trouble with Ghost-Seeing: Vision, Ideology, and Genre in the Victorian Ghost Story." *ELH*, vol. 70, no. 4, 2003, pp. 1107–35. *JSTOR*, http:/www.jstor.org/stable/30029915. Accessed 29 Jan. 2024.

Smith, Andrew. *Gothic Literature*. Edinburgh University Press, 2007.

Sonstroem, David. "Wuthering Heights and the Limits of Vision." *PMLA*, vol. 86, no. 1, 1971, pp. 51–62. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/461001. Accessed 24 May 2024.

Stevenson, John Allen. "'Heathcliff Is Me!': Wuthering Heights and the Question of Likeness." *Nineteenth-Century Literature*, vol. 43, no. 1, 1988, pp. 60–81. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/3044981. Accessed 22 July 2024.

Stoneman, Patsy. “Catherine Earnshaw’s Journey to Her Home among the Dead: Fresh Thoughts on Wuthering Heights and ‘Epipsychidion.’” *The Review of English Studies*, vol. 47, no. 188, 1996, pp. 521–33. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/517928. Accessed 21 May 2024.

Thurschwell, Pamela. *Sigmund Freud*. Routledge, 2009.

Newman, Beth. “‘The Situation of the Looker-On’: Gender, Narration, and Gaze in Wuthering Heights.” *PMLA*, vol. 105, no. 5, 1990, pp. 1029–41. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/462732. Accessed 12 May 2024.

Vine, Steven. “The Wuther of the Other in Wuthering Heights.” *Nineteenth-Century Literature*, vol. 49, no. 3, 1994, pp. 339–59. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/2933820. Accessed 24 May 2024.

Warren, Carol. “The Eyes Have It.” *Ethnography*, vol. 12, no. 4, 2011, pp. 543–55. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/24048020. Accessed 7 Mar. 2024.

Wiltshire, Irene. *The Gaskell Society Journal*, vol. 16, 2002, pp. 112–16. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/45185790. Accessed 5 July 2024.

Woodring, Carl R. “The Narrators of Wuthering Heights.” *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol. 11, no. 4, 1957, pp. 298–305. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/3044458. Accessed 27 Apr. 2024.