

UNIVERZITA PALACKÉHO V OLMOUCI
PEDAGOGICKÁ FAKULTA

Bakalářská práce

UNIVERZITA PALACKÉHO V OLMOUCI

PEDAGOGICKÁ FAKULTA

Ústav cizích jazyků

Bakalářská práce

Martina Kopecká

Anglický jazyk se zaměřením na vzdělávání

A Comparison of John Irving's *The Cider House Rules* and Its
Film Adaptation

Prohlášení:

Prohlašuji, že jsem závěrečnou práci vypracovala samostatně pod vedením Mgr. Petra Anténeho, M.A., Ph.D. s využitím pramenů, které jsou uvedeny v bibliografii.

Pardubice, 16.6. 2019

.....
Martina Kopecká

Acknowledgement:

I would like to express my thanks to my supervisor: Mgr. Petr Anténe, M.A., Ph.D. for his time, support, professional advice, and helpful guidance.

Abstract:

This bachelor thesis aims to compare the novel *The Cider House Rules*, written by John Irving in 1985, and its film adaptation (Miramax, 1999). After a short introduction of the writer and his work, the thesis compares the most important differences between the story featured in the original and the adaptation. The main part of the thesis deals with changes made for individual characters in the context of limitations of film as medium. In chapter 5 the thesis aims to impartially refer to the controversial topic of abortions and how the question of abortions differs in the novel and in the film.

Table of Contents

Introduction	8
1 John Irving – the Author	9
1.1. Working on the Screenplay to <i>The Cider House Rules</i>	9
2 <i>The Cider House Rules</i> – the Novel	12
3 <i>The Cider House Rules</i> – the Film	14
4 The Main Differences between the Novel and the Film	16
4.1 The Tone	16
4.2 The Passage of Time	17
4.3 The Main Characters Kept in the Film	18
4.3.1 Dr. Wilbur Larch	18
4.3.2 Homer Wells	21
4.3.3 Mr. Rose	23
4.3.4 Rose Rose	24
4.3.5 Candy Kendal	25
4.3.6 Wally Worthington	27
4.4 Characters Missing from the Film	28
4.4.1 Melony	28
4.4.2 Angel Wells	30
4.5 Extra Characters in the Film	30
4.5.1 Buster	30
4.5.2 Marry Agnes	31
5 The Differences in the Question of Abortion in the Novel and the Film	32
6 Conclusion	35

Bibliography	36
Appendix 1: Bibliography of John Irving	38
Appendix 2: The Cast	40
Resumé	42
Annotation	43

Introduction

Since the beginning of the cinema, film makers have been adapting literary works into films. The results vary from “flops” to “blockbusters”. Nearly every film enthusiast is excited when his favorite book is being processed into a film. However, a person can be disappointed after visiting the cinema although the adaptation is perfect. Human imagination is individual and it is impossible for screenwriters to meet the expectations of all the viewers.

I first saw the film *The Cider House Rules* when I was a teenager and I loved it. I read the novel in my early twenties and I loved how different it was from the film, yet I started to ask myself questions. Why was the story changed? How could the screenwriters decide to omit Melony? What is Mary Agnes’s purpose in the film?

An uncommon situation occurred in the case of *The Cider House Rules*, when John Irving wrote both the original novel and the screenplay. Furthermore, he also wrote a book describing the process and published it before the film was released. For the name of the book, Irving chose an appropriate title: *My Movie Business: A Memoir* (1999). The word “business” undoubtedly refers to a phrase often used in both the novel and the film. “‘What business you in?’ Orange asked him.”¹ The answers differ – the apple business, the doctor business or, most remarkably, the knife business. The title acknowledges that Irving is now in “the movie business”.

Irving is very thorough when doing research for his books. When working on *Until I Find You* (2005) he got two tattoos as research, because tattoos are an important part of the story.² When working on the novel *The Cider House Rules*, Irving witnessed many surgeries, abortions and child-births, as he states in *My Moving Business*. To understand why the man, who goes to such extremes to better understand his fictional characters, decides to radically change the story and characters of one of his novels is one of the aims of this thesis.

The Cider House Rules deals with abortions. This topic is current in the United States where some of the states have recently decided to change their abortion laws and to make the access to the procedure more limited. Irving’s characters have different opinions on the subject of abortions and a part of this thesis tries to compare if the problematic is displayed differently in the film than in the novel.

¹ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*. p. 403.

² SMITH, Dinitia. *While Excavating Past, John Irving Finds His Family*. In: *The New York Times*.

1 John Irving – the Author

John Winslow Irving (born March 2, 1942) is an American novelist, a short-stories writer and a screenwriter. According to his official internet pages (www.john-irving.com), his first book, *Setting Free the Bears*, was published in 1968. Yet it was not until his fourth book, *The World According to Garp*, which was published ten years later, that he gained an international critical and popular recognition and fame.

To this day, Irving has written 14 novels and several other works (see *Appendix 1 – Bibliography of John Irving*), including a screenplay to *The Cider House Rules* (Buena Vista Pictures, 1999), for which he was awarded the Academy Award for Best Adapt Screenplay in 1999. He has been nominated for a National Book Award three times (winning once, in 1980, for *The World According to Garp*). He also received other awards, such as an O. Henry Award (in 1981, for his short story *Interior Space*) or a Lambda Literary Award (in 2013, for his novel *In One Person*).

Mr. Irving was born in Exeter, New Hampshire, as John Wallace Blunt, Jr. He was raised by his mother Helen and her second husband, Colin Irving. He never met or looked for his father. According to an interview with Dinitia Smith (*The New York Times*, June 28, 2005), he never sought out J. W. Blunt, Sr. out of love and respect for his stepfather. Yet when he got some of his father's old correspondence and learned about his father's adventures in Burma in World War II, the novelist incorporated these stories in his novel *The Cider House Rules* (1985). As revealed in the same interview, Irving often uses his own experiences while writing, from using familiar setting of New England to traumatizing experience of sexual abuse from his childhood.

Irving has two sons from his first marriage, Colin and Brendan. He is now married to his literary agent, Janet Turnbull, with whom he has another son, Everett. He lives in Vermont and Ontario.³

1.1 Working on the Screenplay to *The Cider House Rules*

As Irving states in *My Movie Business, a Memoir* (1999), working on the screenplay of *The Cider House Rules* took him more than thirteen years and during that time he cooperated on it with four different directors – Philip Borsos (*The Mean Season*, *The Grey Fox*), Wayne Wang (*The Joy Luck Club*, *Smoke*), Michael Winterbottom (*Jude*,

³ www.john-irving.com

Welcome to Sarajevo) and finally Lasse Hallström (*My Life as a Dog*, *What's Eating Gilbert Grape*).

Irving and Borsos started to work on the screenplay soon after the book had been published. Irving claims that: “*the first draft was a nine-hour movie. ...the problem was what not to keep in the film.*”⁴ It was difficult for both Irving (who admits in *My Movie Business* that back then the only acceptable adaptation of his novel was a literal one) and Borsos to decide which character or story line to omit, because they both felt that any major cuts would change the main story line too much. Their final draft eliminated Wally and Candy to a couple who gives Homer a ride to the coast. They also let Homer leave the orphanage only for three months, just one apple harvest. And the part of Melony was left out completely.

Unfortunately, this cooperation had come to an end when Borsos, diagnosed with leukemia, got too sick to direct the picture, and eventually died in 1994. Irving mentions that: “*...we tried to find a director to replace him. Ironically, our first choice was Lasse Hallström, the Swedish director who eventually would direct the film—both Phillip and I had loved Hallström’s My Life as a Dog—but Lasse wasn’t available at the time.*”⁵ After Borsos’ death, Irving felt that the movie would never be made.

But in 1995, the novelist met Richard Gladstein, a producer who presented the novel and the last draft of the screenplay to Miramax Film. The production company “*agreed to finance the film, provided that Richard finds an acceptable director. This meant finding someone who was acceptable to Richard, Miramax, and me. The cast had to be “acceptable” to each of us, too. That was the deal. First of all, how hard could finding an acceptable director be? As it turned out, very.*”⁶

One of the directors, that Irving was willing to work with, was Wayne Wang. Yet the cooperation did not last long, because in the case of changes of the script, Irving was more of an agreement with Gladstein. They agreed that it is not good for the future cooperation, if the producer’s advice is more important for the screenwriter than the director’s advice, and parted their ways.

The third director, who cooperated with Irving on the script, was Michael Winterbottom. He suggested to return the Homer-Candy-Wally triangle back to the script. At first Irving refused, but after some persuading from Gladstein and Janet Turnbull, he

⁴ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 32.

⁵ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 36.

⁶ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 56.

rethought that and incorporated the love story into the script. But the cooperation with Winterbottom failed. In the end, he wanted to bring in another writer and Irving refused. He said that “*because of how hard I had worked to make a movie of this novel, I couldn’t walk away from it and let someone else finish the job.*”⁷

When reading *My Movie Business*, one cannot help but think that Lasse Hallström was born to work on the script with Irving. The director’s ideas of using voice-over⁸ and montages to show passage of time were happily greeted by the screenwriter. Also, he resolved the problem with the love triangle by leaving Wally out of the story as much as possible. Then they agreed on making Candy the guilty party and the aggressor in the love affair. Irving finally found a director he could work with, after he had lost his friend P. Borsos, who should have been the director in the first place.

⁷ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 62.

⁸ Cinematographic terms (a scene, voice-over technique, etc.) are used in the sense they are explained in *A short guide to writing about film* (2010) by T. Corrigan.

2 The Cider House Rules – the Novel

According to *My Movie Business* it took Irving four years to write *The Cider House Rules* (1981 – 1985). It is also mentioned there, that most of the novel was imagined while Irving was travelling between his houses in New York, Vermont and Massachusetts.

The novel, as well as the film, is set in the state of Maine, USA. The main part of the novel takes place around the World War II., yet the whole story takes place between 1860's and 1950's.

Homer Wells is an orphan from St. Cloud's who proved to be "unadoptable". After four unfortunate and failed adoptions, he finally asks the director of the orphanage, Doc. Wilbur Larch, to stay in the orphanage permanently. The doctor allows that under one condition. Homer must be of use. That means not just to help around, because Larch has bigger plans for the boy. Homer is a gifted student and Larch trains him in obstetrics. He sees Homer as his follower as both the head of the institution and, more importantly, as someone who would continue in illegal performing of abortions. Yet Homer does not want to do the surgery.

Homer has a complicated relationship with Melony, another orphan. Homer promises her that he would never leave St. Cloud's without her. But in the early 1940's, a young couple, Wally Worthington and Candy Kendal, comes to the hospital to seek the services of an abortionist. Homer leaves with them after Candy goes through an abortion. Melony, feeling betrayed, leaves soon after them to look for Homer.

In Ocean View Orchards, apple orchards owned by Wally's family, Homer quickly becomes best friend with Wally and Candy. He lives in the Worthington's house with Wally and his parents, works in the orchards with black apple pickers and spend his free time with Wally and Candy. He slowly falls in love with Candy who now loves both Wally and Homer. When Wally joins the air force and serves in the World War II., his plane is shot over Burma and he is presumed dead. Accepting his death allows Homer and Candy to start a romantic relationship.

When Candy gets pregnant again, they both decide to go to St. Cloud's so she can have the baby in secret. When Wally is discovered alive but paralyzed from the waist down, Homer and Candy tell everyone that the boy, Angel, is Homer's adoptive son. Soon after that, Candy marries Wally.

They all live together in the Worthington's house and for the next fifteen years, Homer and Candy continue their secret affair and lie. When Melony (whose story is followed through the book) finally finds Homer, she confronts him with this uncomfortable truth.

When Angel is fifteen, he falls in love with Rose Rose, a daughter of the black foreman of the pickers. When Homer and the others found out that the girl is pregnant with her father, Homer performs an abortion on her and decides to go back to St. Cloud's to replace Wilbur Larch, who dies around that time.

In an interview with Mel Gussow (The New York Times, April 28, 1998) Irving claims that when he starts a new book, he has to know its ending. As the story progress, he might change the beginning, but he knows where the story is going since the first page of the manuscript. In other words, the writer knew Homer would eventually go back to the orphanage and was adjusting the story according to this purpose.

3 The Cider House Rules – the Film⁹

While writing the book took Irving about four years, his work on the screenplay took him more than thirteen years. The film was finally shot in 1999 and was released in September in Venice during The Venice Film Festival.¹⁰

During the opening credits, Dr. Larch tells the viewers about failed adoptions of Homer Wells, now the oldest orphan in St. Cloud's orphanage. Larch wants him to become his follower, which includes performing illegal abortions. But Homer is against abortions. When a young couple, Candy and Wally, come to St. Cloud's for Candy's abortion, Homer leaves with them. He starts working at the Ocean View Orchards, which is owned by Wally's family. He lives with black apple-pickers.

When Wally, an air-force pilot, leaves for the World War II, Homer and Candy start a love affair. Homer stays after the apple-picking season, even though the other pickers leave for another season job. The next season, Candy finds out that Rose, a daughter of Arthur Rose, the foreman of the pickers, is pregnant and that the father is Mr. Rose himself. Homer performs his first abortion on Rose Rose. Later Mr. Rose lets his daughter to kill him and run away. Homer and Candy find out that Wally is coming home paralyzed and Homer leaves Ocean View Orchards with the rest of the pickers. He returns back to the orphanage to replace deceased Dr. Larch.

According to *Inside Oscars 2* (2002) by D. Bona, the film was nominated to Academy Awards in 7 categories in 2000 – Best Picture, Best Director, Best Supporting Actor, Best Adapted Screenplay, Best Art Direction, Best Film Editing, and Best Original Score (music). Michael Caine was awarded as the Best Supporting Actor for his Dr. Larch. And John Irving was given the golden statue for the Best Adapted Screenplay. In his acceptance speech he appreciated Miramax for its courage to shot a film about such a controversial topic as abortions. Then he thanked his family and colleagues. At the end, he also thanked the Planned Parenthood and the National Abortion Rights League.¹¹

Irving recalls that the production company, Miramax Films, gave him and Hallström “*fifty-nine-days shooting schedule; they later gave [us] an additional three days.*”¹² He also states in *My Movie Business*, that it was strange feeling to see his screenplay adapted into a film. He also played a small (two scenes) part in the film – the

⁹ For the full cast see *Appendix 2 – The Cast*.

¹⁰ Česko-Slovenská filmová databáze © 2001-2019. POMO Media Group s.r.o. [quoted 2019-06-1]. Available from: <https://www.csfd.cz/film/4086-pravidla-mostarny/zajimavosti/?type=film>

¹¹ The acceptance speech can be accessed on youtube: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UJOYSgdPiH0>

¹² IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 91.

stationmaster who witness Homer's return to St- Cloud's in the end of the movie. *"I had asked for the part. For almost twenty years, I had envisioned Homer stepping off that train and coming "home." I told Richard that I wanted to see that scene from the perspective of the stationmaster, who has witnessed so many pregnant women come to St. Cloud's and leave without their babies."*¹³

¹³ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 84.

4 The Main Differences between the Novel and the Film

4.1 The Tone

The tone of the film is certainly more cheerful than the tone of the novel. From the scenes from the orphanage one could think that it is an idyllic place to live in. In the opening credits we can see a big building on a hill surrounded by woods. The orphans take care of each other, the older children protect the younger ones. In the evening, they all listen to stories. They do snowball fighting in winter, play baseball in summer and carve jack-o'-lanterns in the autumn. And from time to time a nice couple comes and takes one of them home with them.

In the novel, St. Cloud's is a former logging camp set in a damp and misty climate. The children are what they are. Some are nice, some are angry and vulgar, and those who understand the concept of adoption dream about a nice couple that would take them away. And when they finally get a family, it is sometimes a disappointment for them, because the family is not what they have dreamt about.

According to Irving, one of the biggest fears he had about the film was that it would be seen by the audience as a love story. When he agreed to bring back the love triangle (during his work with *Winterbottom*) he was worried: *"Now that the Homer-Candy-Wally romance was in the screenplay, [...] I was afraid that the love story was threatening to become what the movie was about."*¹⁴ Miramax probably felt differently. The official poster (below)¹⁵ features Homer and Candy having a good time together and does not suggest the movie is anything else but a love-story.



¹⁴ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 62.

¹⁵ Property of Miramax ®, source: <https://www.miramax.com/movie/the-cider-house-rules/>

Also, the official trailer for the movie¹⁶ leaves out any mention of abortions although it shows Larch being angry with Homer and the young man leaving the orphanage. Yet all the scenes shown in the trailer suggest that *The Cider House Rules* is a film about a young man finding himself when he finds the woman he loves. However, the relationship of Homer and Candy is featured only in about an hour of the total footage of the film, and the most emotional moments that the film deals with do not focus on the lovers' love, but on parental love of Dr. Larch towards Homer, incest, and, of course, abortions.

4.2 The Passage of Time

In the book, Irving is indefinite about the exact time of the events. He always mentions the decade but does not mention the year. The reader has a more precise estimate only because of the mention of incidents like the Pearl Harbor attack. A very different approach was chosen for the movie. After the opening credits, a date shows on the screen, telling the viewer it is March 1943.

The novel covers almost one hundred years, mentioning Larch's childhood in the 1860's and ending shortly after his death in the 1950's. Candy and Wally come to the orphanage in the early 1940's and Wally comes back home by the end of the World War II. The longest part of the novel takes place during that period. After Wally's arrival, the narrator skips fifteen years into the future and Irving apprizes his readers of some important moments of the omitted time only in flashbacks and quickly moves towards the outcome of the story.

Despite the necessity to leave out the complicated history of Wilbur Larch from the film, it was necessary to keep some part of Homer's history there, to show how exceptional and dear he is to Larch. It was already mentioned that it was Hallström's idea to use voice-over the opening credits. Homer's failed adoptions and his beginnings as Larch's apprentice are described by the doctor himself over a montage of scenes that takes about six minutes. It takes about 100 pages in the book.

The voice-over technique is then used in the second part of the movie, right after the apple-pickers leave the bunk house. There, the director uses the voice-over again while Homer's and Larch's voices read from letters exchanged between the two to show

¹⁶ The trailer can be accessed here: <https://www.miramax.com/movie/the-cider-house-rules/>

their continuing disagreement about Homer's future as a doctor. In addition, their father-son-like relationship is shown there. The images show the audience the passing of time and the continuing affair of Homer and Candy. The four-minutes long montage ends with the pickers coming back to the bunk house for a new season. It cannot be compared to the length of the events in writing, because the course of the events in the film and the novel differ to a great degree at that point.

The usage of voice-over was a very strategic move. In both cases, long periods of time, that are important to the story, are told in minutes, but it does not decrease the importance of the events they are depicting.

4.3 The Main Characters Kept in the Film

There is a great number of characters in the novel. It was impossible to put them all into a two-hour long film, or to give them as much space as in the book. Very important characters of Melony and Angel were totally omitted. The roles of Wally, the nurses, Olive Worthington and Ray Kendal were reduced to a minimum. However, other characters, like Buster or Mary Agnes, were added to the film to compensate for the limitations of the film and to substitute for some of the omitted characters.

4.3.1 Dr. Wilbur Larch

As Irving says in *My Movie Business*, the character of Dr. Wilbur Larch is loosely based on his grandfather, Dr. Frederick C. Irving. They share education, some job experiences and some of the stories described in *The Cider House Rules* happened in reality to Dr. Irving. It is not stated directly if he approved of abortions, yet he stated that “as long as there are unwanted pregnancies, women will attempt to rid themselves of them.”¹⁷

Dr. Irving was a fabled doctor, who “even for years after he retired... was known as *The Great God Irving of the Boston Lying-In*.”¹⁸ Throughout the novel, the nurses in St. Cloud's refer to Larch as Saint Larch. J. Irving describes his grandfather as an impressive figure surrounded by the smell of ether and Dr. Larch is also a tall man surrounded by the ether smell. Finally, it is interesting to mention that he is an author of

¹⁷ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 11.

¹⁸ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 14.

an obscene poem and it is probable that this inspired John Irving to make Wally and his father fond of obscene limericks.

In the novel, Dr. Larch was born in Portland in the 1860's, studied at Harvard Medical School and started his professional career in the South End Branch of the Boston Lying-In¹⁹. We know his background story: a little about his childhood, parents and education; his first and only sexual experience; the beginning of his medical practice; the reasons why he started to perform abortions and came to St. Cloud's to start the orphanage and the hospital there. In fact, in *The Cider House Rules*, there is a whole chapter²⁰ dealing with his life before he comes to St. Cloud's. Whereas it may seem redundant and not of much of an importance, on those pages the reader gets to know Dr. Larch – his motives, the reason for his ether addiction and his bitterness.

His ether addiction is very important because near the end of the story the doctor dies because of an accidental overdose. The ether slowly weaves through the whole story. The book often emphasizes that Dr. Larch smells of ether – there are many passages about him using the ether and it is even mentioned in the very first paragraph of the novel: “*His name was Wilbur Larch, which, except for the scent of ether that always accompanied him...*”²¹ There are four scenes where we can see Larch sniff the ether in the film.

Although Wilbur Larch is one of the two main characters of the novel, he does not seem that important in the film. His background story was omitted – as Irving himself admits in *My Movie Business* – due to the length of the footage. As a result, the doctor's character needed to be changed. “The book's Larch” is, for most of the story, a strict, somehow bitter old man, a professional in his field (the legal and the illegal one), and an ether addict. But the reader knows all the reasons that have formed his personality: he has only one unfortunate sexual experience, and is infected by a venereal disease, gonorrhea, on that occasion; he treats himself, uses the ether to relieve himself of the pain and becomes an ether addict; he witnesses painful and preventable deaths of his only sexual partner, Mrs. Eames, and her daughter, and he blames himself for their deaths until he dies; he performs his first abortion on a teenage girl who was abused by her own father and realizes that now he simply cannot refuse to perform this kind of surgery anymore, so he leaves for St. Cloud's.²² All these moments formed him into a seemingly cold man.

¹⁹ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*.

²⁰ Chapter 2, *The Lord's Work*, p. 56-97.

²¹ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 13.

²² IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*.

However, none of them is in the film. On the other hand, the film's Larch, played by Michael Caine, has the aura of a friendly uncle around himself, for most of the film.

In the novel, until Homer Wells gets the chance to leave St. Cloud's, we can see only a very little affection on Larch's side to any of the orphans, or anybody else except the pregnant women who came to the orphanage to seek his services. His argument about abortions with Homer goes through the whole novel, but for a long time, he respects Homer's decisions and only hopes that Homer will change his mind eventually. The film's Dr. Larch is very kind to all of the orphans. He carries warm feelings especially towards Homer and a little sick boy called Fuzzy Stone.

When Homer Wells decides to leave the orphanage, the book's and film's doctor behave very differently. In the book, it is Larch who comes up with the idea of Homer leaving and encourages him to stay away for some time. He even persuades the other members of personnel to give Homer some money and tells the boy he loves him. In the film, the departure is Homer's idea and Larch is so upset with the boy that he does not even come outside the orphanage to say good-bye to him.

There is also a clear notion in the film that Wilbur Larch had, or still has, an intimate relationship with nurse Angela.

INT. DISPENSARY – MORNING

Angela is singing along with the song on the phonograph, a more romantic song than before, which rouses Larch from his ether. He is grumpy, but she sings the song in his ear and won't give him back the ether cone; he rolls away from her, but she tickles him and bites his ear, coaxing him into a more playful mood.

LARCH

*I was dreaming about you. How beautiful you were!*²³

In the scene, M. Caine as Larch playfully teases Kathy Barker as nurse Angela. This is very different behavior from the original Wilbur Larch from the book who is a sexual abstinent. For Irving, the reason to show the affection Larch has for Angela is

²³ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script.*

simple: “I wanted to make Larch more normal. There is less time for character development in a film than in a novel; a character’s eccentricities can too easily become the character. In the movie, I thought Larch’s addiction to ether was eccentric enough.”

²⁴ This statement perfectly explains all the changes done in the case of Larch. He is a such a complex character, that there was not enough time to keep him intact in the film.

4.3.2 Homer Wells

Homer Wells is not so different in the film from the book character. He was born in the orphanage; there were some attempts to adopt him, but they failed; he is a clever young man and a talented obstetrician and surgeon; he does not want to perform abortions, or to replace Dr. Larch in St. Cloud’s; he cares for Dr. Larch deeply; he falls in love with Candy; he returns to his birthplace after he performs an abortion on Rose Rose.

Nevertheless, some important changes were done in Homer’s case. First, there are four failed adoptions in the book. The first two are featured in the film. There were originally three, but the last one was different from the book. Homer gets adopted at the age of sixteen but the parents send him back to the orphanage after they find out he was having sex with their daughter.²⁵ However, the scenes were crossed out from the final cut and so Homer is presumably sexually inexperienced when he later arrives in Ocean View Orchards.

In the book, Homer has a sexual relationship with Melony long before he leaves with Wally and Candy. He also dates a girl who works in the orchards before his relationship with Candy gets physical. As Irving explains in *My Movie Business*, Homer had to become “a likable, innocent, inward-looking boy”.²⁶ As in the case of Caine (Larch), casting found the right person. Tobey Maguire looks as a young boy, full of expectations, when he leaves the orphanage with Theron (Candy) and Rudd (Wally).

Homer is in love with Candy from the first moment he sees her in the novel: “...he’d [Larch] not seen Homer so agitated in anyone’s presence before. Homer fancies he’s in love! thought Dr. Larch.”²⁷ However, Wally becomes his best friend very soon, so Homer forbids himself to even think about Candy in a romantic way. When he finally tells her how he feels and finds out that she loves him back, he still does not do anything

²⁴ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 10.

²⁵ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script*.

²⁶ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 68.

²⁷ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 250.

to jeopardize Wally's friendship. Their relationship becomes physical only after they both presume Wally dead.

In the film, Homer is also stunned by Candy. In a scene where Homer is picking apples with the other pickers, he says about Candy: "*She's the nicest and the most beautiful girl I've ever known.*"²⁸ Homer does not spend much time with Wally and so cannot really befriend him. His affair with Candy is not troubled with Wally's feelings. Irving made sure that Homer would not be seen by the viewers as a negative character. He clarifies the affair in *My Movie Business* this way: "*Candy is wrong to have the affair. From the beginning, she's the one to blame.*"²⁹

Another important moment for both Homers is him performing an abortion on Rose Rose. It is Candy's reaction to getting the information about Wally's paralysis that gets Homer go through the surgery in the film.

CANDY

(yelling and sobbing)

*He's *paralyzed*!*

(anguished)

*What do you want me to *do*?*

He faces away from her.

HOMER

(with calm resolve)

*Nothing. You're not the one who has to do anything.*³⁰

After that conversation, Homer confronts Mr. Rose and his daughter and tells them he can help Rose Rose. Next time he speaks to Candy alone, he is clearly decided to leave Ocean View Orchards. His decision only strengthens when he learns about Larch's death in the following scene. In a way, Larch vacated his position for Homer, gave him a place to go – back to the orphanage, where he is needed the most now.

In the novel, Irving lets Homer find out that Larch has just passed away when he phones to St. Cloud's to arrange an abortion for Rose Rose. Only when he sees there is no other possibility to help the girl (sending her to another abortionist is not a safe option in his eyes), he helps her himself. The night after the surgery he decides to replace his former tutor, under the name Dr. Fuzzy Stone, and to continue in Larch's work, even

²⁸ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script.*

²⁹ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 67.

³⁰ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script.*

though he still does not agree with abortions. His point of view is cleared in the passage where he meets with the board of trustees and is appointed as the head of the orphanage and hospital in St. Cloud's: "*On the matter of abortions, Dr. Stone surprised the board by the adamant conviction he held: that they should be legalized, and that he intended to work through the proper channels toward that end. However, Dr. Stone assured them, as long as abortions were illegal, he would rigorously uphold the law.*"³¹ In fact, to any reader it must be clear that Homer is decided to perform the surgery right to the point it is legalized and then stop.

As Irving says in *My Movie Business*, Homer is a passive character. He makes decisions only if he has to. In the novel, that is absolutely the case. For example, he wants his son to know the truth about his ancestry, but does not tell him anything for fifteen years, until he is confronted by Melony and forced to operate on Rose Rose by the circumstances. In the film, he is less passive. It is his idea to leave the orphanage. Later, he decides to help Rose Rose by himself, he is the one who directly confronts Mr. Rose about the incestual relationship and his daughter's pregnancy. But in both versions of the story, he "*turns out to be the hero of his own life.*"³²

4.3.3 Mr. Rose

Arthur Rose is the foreman of the apple-pickers. No-one calls him by his first name, including his employers – his authority is undeniable. He is a very complex and complicated character. He requires everyone to work hard and to follow certain rules. Nevertheless, those rules do not need to be in accordance with the law.

Mr. Rose is the only one of the major characters who does not develop throughout the story. We first meet him when he returns to the orchards with his crew the year Homer gets there as well. Rose looks like Wally's age, early twenties, even though he is probably older, considering that he has been the foreman for six or seven years. Homer soon finds out that the black man is "in the knife business", meaning he can handle a knife very well and that he is a dangerous man.

It appears that Mr. Rose's authority originates not only from his abilities as the foreman, but is also supported by a certain level of fear. The other pickers warn Angel not to irritate him and to stay away from his daughter, Rose Rose, though none of them

³¹ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 709.

³² This quotation is an extract from the opening passage of Dicken's *David Copperfield*. It is Homer's favorite book and the quote is used both in the film and, on many occasions, in the novel.

states directly why. The level of power Mr. Rose has over the men is best displayed in the passage where his incestual relationship with his daughter is revealed – all the men have already known about it, yet they have not done or said anything.

In the film, Mr. Rose is much older (he is probably in his forties, though his age is not mentioned)³³ because the author needed his daughter to be old enough. Casting the role of Arthur Rose was crucial to Irving. “*American film culture is full of sympathetic villains, but they are not fathers who have sex with their children. Even if, in the end, Mr. Rose is heroic—he sacrifices himself to save his daughter—it is a role that requires great courage and confidence in the actor who accepts it.*”³⁴ Delroy Lindo was chosen for the part many years before the script was finished by Irving and Borsos and, as Irving acknowledges in *My Movie Business*, “*the passage of time has only improved his appearance; he is still lean, but he has more history in his face, more sympathy.*”³⁵

In the scene depicting Rose Rose’s abortion, Homer asks Mr. Rose to handle the ether. It is the first time anyone is in charge of Mr. Rose. The worries of a father for his daughter’s life and his guilt are perfectly reflected on Lindo’s face. The day after the surgery he willingly lets another picker be the foreman for the day. He clearly feels his life, as he has known it, ended even before Rose Rose stabbed him.³⁶

The death of Mr. Rose is tragic and heroic at the same time in both the book and the film. It is tragic because it was not necessary. Had he told anyone about his injury, he could have been saved. And it is heroic, because by choosing not to tell anyone he gave his daughter a chance to run away.

Except his age, the character of Mr. Rose was not changed for the purposes of the film, where, as well as in the book, he is a charismatic and dangerous man and nobody dares to cross him.

4.3.4 Rose Rose

While the character of Mr. Rose was not modified in the screenplay, his daughter is a very different character in the two conceptions of the story.

Rose Rose is first mentioned in the book as Mr. Rose’s baby daughter, who later stops coming along for the picking with her father. She appears again when she is about

³³ According to Lindo’s profile on www.csfd.cz, the actor was born in November 1952, therefore being 46 at the time the film was shot.

³⁴ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 76.

³⁵ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 76.

³⁶ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script*.

seventeen and she brings her own baby daughter to Ocean Views Orchards. She is a very paradoxical character. She is being abused by her own father, yet she flirts with Angel, even seduces him, and at the same time tries to warn him: *“She showed him [Angel] only the cuts on her back—they were fine, thread-thin, razorlike cuts; they were extremely deliberate, very careful cuts that would heal completely in a day or two. They were slightly deeper than scratches; they were not intended to leave scars. ‘I told you,’ she said to Angel, but she still kissed him, hard. ‘You shouldn’t have no business with me. I ain’t really available.’”*³⁷ Whether she does that because she genuinely likes the boy, or because she feels his family can help her to get away from her father, is not explained anywhere in the novel.

The film’s Rose Rose is childless and there is no notion of her having any romantic relationship with anyone. She cares for others - she can see Homer is interested in Candy and tries to warn him. In the film, she is older than her novel’s version but still young enough to cause difficulties during the casting process, as Irving mentioned. *“If Rose Rose looked as young as we wanted her to look, what if she couldn’t act? If she could act, she would probably look too old.”*³⁸ Luckily, Erykah Badu, who was chosen for the role, had the right look and her performance in front of the camera was very convincing. Irving also appreciates her performance in *My Movie Business*: *“She and Delroy needed to demonstrate some completely natural father-daughter affection before their relationship darkened and became sexual. Delroy couldn’t do that alone.”*³⁹

4.3.5 Candy Kendal

Candy Kendal is a young woman who comes to St. Cloud’s with her boyfriend, Wally, to get an abortion and later starts a relationship with Homer Wells. The reason to undergo the illegal surgery in the film differs from the reason in the novel. In the book, Candy and Wally decide that they are too young to have a baby and also that they both want to finish university before they start a family together. In the screenplay, Candy defends her decision in front of Homer on their way from the orphanage after her surgery.

CANDY

I couldn't have a baby with someone who's leaving me--I didn't know what else to do!

³⁷ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 665.

³⁸ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 78.

³⁹ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 78.

Homer is a doctor--he's used to post abortion reactions.

HOMER

I know.

CANDY

He's going to be dropping bombs on Mandalay! They're going to be shooting at him!

HOMER

Where's Mandalay?

CANDY

Burma!

HOMER

Oh...

CANDY

I can't have a baby alone. I don't even know if he's coming back!

HOMER

I understand.⁴⁰

Unfortunately, this scene did not stay in the film. It offers a deeper insight into Candy's personality and reflects her anger towards Wally and his decision to join the army. The only mention of the latter in the film is after the scene in which she has sex with Homer for the first time and without the context it may seem she is only trying to justify her infidelity.

In all the scenes where Charlize Theron (Candy) and Paul Rudd (Wally) are together, the audience can see that they are in love. Candy is not interested in Homer until Wally leaves for the war. The reason she starts an affair with Homer is, as Irving explains in *My Movie Business*, because he is safe and cannot seriously threaten her relationship with Wally. He also explains why she is responsible for the affair in the film: "*The constant burden of compressing a story means that somebody's character is going to get compromised. By reducing Wally's time on camera, and diminishing his relationship with Homer, we gave Homer less responsibility for the affair with Candy—that's true. But the character who gets compromised is Candy. To save Homer from the audience's condemnation, Lasse and I made Candy the guilty party.*"⁴¹

In the book, it is obvious that Candy has feelings for Homer soon after they meet. She realizes the complexity of the situation: "*Candy was also awake, and also worried.*

⁴⁰ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script.*

⁴¹ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 67.

*If he does stay, if he doesn't go back to St. Cloud's, she was thinking, what will I do?*⁴² And the two of them admit their feeling for each other before Wally even joins the Air Force: *"I love you," Homer Wells croaked, as if he were saying his last words. 'Yes, I know—don't think about it,' Candy said. 'Don't worry about anything. I love you, too.' 'You do?' he asked. 'Yes, yes, and Wally too,' she said. 'I love you and I love Wally.'*⁴³ Yet they do not make love until both of them are persuaded that Wally died in Asia.

Due to reducing the love story from the novel into an affair in the film, the character of Candy had to be radically changed. Indeed, comparing both versions of Candy may give the impression that only her stunning appearance was maintained. However, both of them are kind women who care for the people around them and are faced with uneasy choices, which they handle differently.

4.3.6 Wally Worthington

Wally's part in the novel is almost as important as Candy's. He is Homer's best friend and Candy's boyfriend (and later her husband). He is handsome, clever and brave, yet also unreasonable to some extent: *"People in Heart's Haven and in Heart's Rock always said that Wally had everything: money, looks, goodness, charm, the girl of his dreams—but he had courage, too, and he had in abundance youth's most dangerous qualities: optimism and restlessness. He would risk everything he had to fly the plane that could carry the bomb within him."*⁴⁴

He is faced with a very difficult choice to make, not unlike Homer and Candy. After he returns from the war, he accepts the fact that Homer and Candy have a baby together, accepts their choice to pretend that Angel is adopted, and they all live together in Wally's house. It shows a deep love and respect he carries for them, which can be deduced from this passage of the book: *"And the thing about being in love," Wally said to Angel, 'is that you can't force anyone. It's natural to want someone you love to do what you want, or what you think would be good for them, but you have to let everything happen to them. You can't interfere with people you love any more than you're supposed to interfere with people you don't even know. And that's hard,' he added, 'because you often feel like interfering—you want to be the one who makes the plans.'*⁴⁵

⁴² IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 340.

⁴³ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 438.

⁴⁴ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 450.

⁴⁵ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 697.

For reasons that have been already mentioned in this thesis, Wally's part in the film was deduced to a minimum. Paul Rudd's character spends barely ten minutes on the screen. We meet him as a lieutenant with the US Air Force. He has an aura of a young adventurer around him and before the audience can learn any important details about him, he goes back to the war. He reappears near the film's end for a few seconds in a scene that concentrates on Homer and Candy's last exchange of looks.

The casting of Wally Worthington has an interesting history. In *My Movie Business*, Irving admits he wanted his son, Colin Irving, to play the role. Due to delays of the work on the screenplay, Colin became too old to play the part. He appears in the movie nonetheless, in a small part of Major Winslow who apprises Candy, Homer and Olive Worthington with the circumstances of Wally's injury. Irving further reveals that he wanted Major Winslow to represent what Wally could have been if his plane had not been shot down. *"I wanted Major Winslow to be the image of how Candy might have imagined Wally looking when he came back. Homer might have imagined Wally returning like Major Winslow, too—that is, if Wally had survived the war intact. Nor was the irony lost on my son Colin and me: that Colin was now too old to play Wally made him a perfect Major Winslow. But, at thirty-four, Colin had imagined himself in the role of Wally for a decade; that he was forced to accept the much smaller role of Major Winslow was a disappointment to him, and to me."*⁴⁶

4.4 Important Characters Missing from the Film

4.4.1 Melony

Melony is an orphan from St. Cloud's and is one of the most impressive characters in *The Cider House Rules*. She is the oldest orphan there and also the biggest. Melony loves Homer and for some time they are lovers, even though the relationship is only physical on Homer's part. Yet she dominates him. He is scared of her and for a long time feels that he can never leave the orphanage due to a promise he once gave her – that they would never leave the place without the other one. When Homer leaves, Melony is devastated and sets out to look for him.

She finally finds him the same autumn Homer is forced to perform his first abortion. When she sees Angel, Melony claims that he is the image of his father when he was his age. Homer unsuccessfully tries to persuade her that Angel is adopted. When

⁴⁶ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 69.

Melony learns more about the whole situation, she, who once proclaimed that if she ever finds her mother she would kill her, is disgusted by Homer so much she vomits. She confronts Homer when they are alone: *“I somehow thought you'd end up doin' somethin' better than ballin' a poor cripple's wife and pretendin' your own child ain't your own,” Melony said to Homer Wells. ‘You of all people—you, an orphan,’ she reminded him. [...] ‘Don’t be snotty to me!’ Melony cried, her raw face streaked with tears. ‘You’ve got your nose in the air—I got that part right. But you ain’t exactly no missionary. You’re a creep! You knocked up somebody you shouldn’t ‘a’ been fuckin’ in the first place, and you couldn’t even come clean about it to your own kid. Some missionary! Ain’t that brave? In my book, Sunshine, that’s a creep,’ Melony told him.*”⁴⁷

After fifteen years of living in a lie, several minutes spent with Melony are enough to cause Homer to tell everybody the truth about Angel and he announces his intention to Candy the same day: *“I love you, but we’re becoming bad people,” he said. She stamped her foot. ‘We’re not bad people!’ she cried. ‘We’re trying to do the right thing, we’re trying not to hurt anybody!’ ‘We’re doing the wrong thing,’ said Homer Wells. ‘It’s time to do everything right.’”*⁴⁸

One conversation with Melony is enough to persuade Homer to face the biggest fear and disgrace of his life. Her personality is that strong. In the end, regardless of how angry she was with Homer, her body arrives in St. Cloud’s for Homer to use to improve his surgical abilities: *“Melony had seen a photograph in the Bath paper, together with an article revealing Dr. Stone’s appointment in St. Cloud’s. In the event of her death (which was caused by an electrical accident), Melony had instructed Lorna to send her body to Dr. Stone in St. Cloud’s. ‘I might be of some use to him, finally.’”*⁴⁹ She never realizes she was of use to Homer already, when she forced him to set things right.

It was not possible to incorporate Melony into the storyline Irving finally decided to use for the screenplay in the same extent as in the book: *“I eliminated her from the screenplay; she was simply too overpowering a character. Over and over again, the limitation imposed on the length of a movie has consequences [...] It pained me to lose Melony, but I had to do it.”*⁵⁰

⁴⁷ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 612-613.

⁴⁸ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 616.

⁴⁹ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 717.

⁵⁰ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 7-8.

4.4.2 Angel Wells

Angel is a son of Candy and Homer. He was born in St. Cloud's in secret. After his birth, his parents learn about Wally's survival and decide to pretend they adopted him to spare Wally's feelings.⁵¹

In the course of the story, Angel is important because he finds out about Rose Rose's second pregnancy. Yet when Irving decided to reduce Homer's life in Ocean Views to a fifteen months long experience, he prevented the possibility to use Angel for that purpose in the film. Therefore, it is Homer himself who, due to his experiences with pregnancies from St. Cloud's, figures out that Rose Rose is pregnant: "*Since I eliminated Angel from the screenplay, I made Homer find out about Rose Rose's pregnancy directly.*"⁵²

4.5 Extra Characters in the Film

*"In screenplays that are adaptations from novels, you must occasionally create new characters to represent those lost moments in the lives of the original characters—hence Buster (Kieran Culkin), to represent Homer as-a-kid. You must also create new characters to compensate for whole characters who are missing from the script—hence Mary Agnes (Paz de la Huerta), to represent both Melony, who is such a huge loss, and Nurse Caroline (also missing), who is romantically paired with Homer at the novel's end."*⁵³

4.5.1 Buster

Buster, an orphan a few years younger than Homer, helps around the orphanage and the hospital not unlike Homer does. We can see him driving a car, helping Homer to dig a grave for a dead patient and carrying firewood. He also quarrels with Homer about Larch's addiction, claiming the doctor always smells of the ether and that he, Buster, saw Larch sniffing it. Homer defends Dr. Larch, claiming he is only tired and the ether helps him sleep. As a matter of fact, Homer has a similar argument with Melony in the book.

⁵¹ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*.

⁵² IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 7.

⁵³ IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 69.

Considering Buster's feelings, he probably sees a brother in Homer. It is understandable that a teenage boy, who is too old to hope to be adopted one day, desires to have anyone he could see as a family member. Larch is too reserved for him – the doctor already has a son and it is Homer, not Buster. According to the scene where Homer leaves the orphanage, his feelings for Buster are also brotherly:

HOMER
*I have to go, Curly. I'm sorry.
(to Edna)
I couldn't find Buster. Will you tell him...*

He can't finish what he has to say. Edna kisses him good-bye.⁵⁴

It has not been confirmed anywhere in the sources used for this thesis, but the casting may have intended to encourage this concept. K. Culkin and T. Maguire resemble each other in a way brothers could.

Irving kept a very emotional part in the film – the mood in the orphanage after the death of Fuzzy Stone. Buster and Larch burry Fuzzy and Larch orders the boy to tell the other orphans that Fuzzy has been adopted. Buster obeys and when telling the others, he adds a story about the adopting family, claiming they have a better medical machine for Fuzzy. Larch, listening behind a closed door, weeps. In the book, however, Larch tells the children about “the adoption” himself and Homer only supports the lie. Later, Homer cries out Fuzzy's name in frustration in the woods to relieve himself of the pain.

4.5.2 Mary Agnes

Mary Agnes is a mild version of Melony. She is younger than Homer, not as big as Melony and more innocent than her. She is clearly in love with Homer. She tries to flirt with him without success before he leaves the orphanage. However, the shot in which Homer looks at Mary Agnes after he returns to St. Cloud's suggests that now, after his affair with Candy, he will not be as indifferent to her seduction. Mary Agnes's part in the film is hereby formed into a replacement of nurse Caroline as well, a socialist who supports women's rights and whom Homer sends to St. Cloud's to help Larch in his work. When Homer joins her and the other nurses in the orphanage, they become a couple: “*And, after a while, he [Homer] would write to Candy and say that he had become a*

⁵⁴ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script.*

socialist; or, at least, that he'd become sympathetic to socialist views. Candy understood by this confession that Homer was sleeping with Nurse Caroline. “⁵⁵

5 The Differences in the Question of Abortion in the Novel and the Film

There are many topics in *The Cider House Rules* that are considered controversial even today, thirty-three years after the book was published, for example incest, prostitution, rape, or racism. However, the main topic is the question of abortions, the right of a woman to choose an abortion and the legalization of the surgery. Many of the characters have a personal experience with abortions, whether they underwent the procedure or performed it, or have a close relationship to a person who underwent the surgery. The storyline itself can be viewed as a background for a discussion about abortions, a subject primarily discussed by Homer and Dr. Larch.

According to a historian Leslie Reagan, abortions were legal in the USA before the 1880's. In her book *When Abortion Was a Crime* (1998) she further states that the criminalization of abortions was not a question of women's safety, or a concern with morality. “*The impetus was manifold. Some of it came "out of regular physicians' desire to win professional power, control medical practice, and restrict their competitors," namely midwives and homeopaths.*”⁵⁶ Abortion was legalized again in 1973 by the U.S. Supreme Court, but the individual states are allowed to specify the condition under which women are allowed to ask for an abortion.⁵⁷

The Cider House Rules takes place at the time when abortions were illegal. Larch takes a risk when he helps any woman that comes to seek his services. In the book, due to the introduction to Larch's life before St. Cloud's, the readers know about his motive. The motive is not profit but his experiences with women's desperate attempts to abort their pregnancies and their consequences. Whereas his motives are not discussed in the film, there is a scene depicting his annoyance with the law. When Homer and Buster are digging a grave for a twelve-year-old girl who died of consequences of an unprofessionally performed abortion, Dr. Larch answers Buster's question about the means of the girl's death: “*She died of secrecy, she died of ignorance.*” Then he asks

⁵⁵ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*, p. 716.

⁵⁶ RAVITZ, Jessica: *The Surprising History of Abortion in the United States*.

⁵⁷ RAVITZ, Jessica: *The Surprising History of Abortion in the United States*.

Homer: *“If you expect people to be responsible for their children, you have to give them the right to decide whether or not to have children. Wouldn't you agree?”*⁵⁸

Homer does not share Larch's opinion. He believes that the fetus has a life. In the novel, it is stated on many occasions that his decision not to perform abortions is based on his morality. However, Homer has only one replica regarding the topic: *“Try to look at it this way. Buster and I are sitting right here beside you. We could have ended up in the incinerator!”*⁵⁹

The doctor is very frustrated by Homer's opinion. Yet in the book, Larch respects it, though he never stops in his effort to persuade Homer to become his follower as the head of St. Cloud's orphanage and hospital and to perform abortions. In the book, he eventually grants Larch's wishes but he is willing to do the surgery only for the time it is illegal and the women have no other safe place to go. However, in the film we only see him to return to the orphanage and there is no mention about his current opinion.

Irving could have used a contemporary setting for his novel and film. By placing the story into the past though, it was noticeably easier for him to stay impartial. Yet he inclines to favor the women's right to choose what to do with their bodies, as Helena Walstorm claims in her article *Reproduction, Politics, and John Irving's The Cider House Rules*: *“The novel represents abortion as a social practice involving both men and women, and stresses gendered and sexualized positions of empowerment and need. Although as a whole, the narrative is a voice in favor of women's “right to choice.”*⁶⁰

In *Inside Oscar 2*, Bona quotes Sean Mitchell from the *New York Daily News* who pointed out an interesting feature of the film: *“How is it that a movie that makes a subtle and historic argument for a woman's right to an abortion also seems to be about the old-fashioned importance of family? [...] While The Cider House Rules is making the case (some would say) for a woman's right to choose and a doctor's right to help her, it then does something else unexpected and at least as powerful. It makes us appreciate the values of the nuclear family—by its absence.”*⁶¹

While writing *My Movie Business*, Irving was sure the film would do the book justice in the case of abortions. He mentions that he made sure to be on the set for shooting

⁵⁸ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script.*

⁵⁹ IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script.*

⁶⁰ WAHLSTRÖM, Helena: *Reproduction, Politics, and John Irving's The Cider House Rules, Culture Unbound*, Volume 5, p. 257.

⁶¹ BONA, Damien. *Inside Oscar 2*, Kindle locations 9662-9667.

of two scenes, where a twelve-year-old pregnant girl comes to Larch for help. In the scene, the doctor finds out that the girl had been pregnant for at least five months and that she visited another abortionist, who left a crochet hook inside the girl. Irving states that: *“It was not until I’d seen both of these scenes shot, as I had written them, that I felt certain of the film’s essential fidelity to the novel.”*⁶²

⁶² IRVING, John. *My Movie Business*, p. 99.

6 Conclusion

Irving states on many occasions in *My Movie Business* that the story principally deals with abortions and that he fears it would be seen by the audience as a love story. On the internet pages concerned with films (like www.csfd.cz, www.imdb.com and others), it is generally described as a drama, or a drama and romance film. The romantic part of the film is a significant component, although it does not dominate the story.

Serious changes that have been made during the screenwriting process are defended by Irving in *My Movie Business*. Although the subtitle of the book (*A Memoir*) indicates it is merely a collection of memories associated with the work on the film, Irving also uses it as a defense of his choices. It can be deduced from many passages of the book that he was optimistic about the outcome of the film (which had not premiered yet at the time *My Movie Business* was completed).

The critiques also consider the film a success, although not a faithful adaptation of the novel. Many reviews that occurred in reputable newspapers (for example *New York Times*, *Newsday* and others) described the adaptation as a film about a young man's journey to find himself and his place in the world or a kind and gentle narrative that would please the audience.

From the perspective of an impartial observer, the novel *The Cider House Rules* presents a different story than its film adaptation. The main message, though, is clear in both versions – important life decisions are rarely realized without further consequences and every individual should be given a chance to decide independently. For that reason, both versions can be considered well-executed.

Bibliography

IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules*. New York: Bantam Books, 1989. ISBN 0-553-25800-1.

IRVING, John. *My Movie Business: A Memoir*. New York: Random House, 1999. ISBN 978-0-345-44130-0.

BONA, Damien. *Inside Oscar 2*. Balantine Books, 2002. ISBN 978-0345449702

CORRIGAN, Timothy. *A short guide to writing about film*. 7rd ed. New York: Longman, 2010. ISBN 978-0-205-66894-6.

WAHLSTRÖM, Helena: "Reproduction, Politics, and John Irving's *The Cider House Rules*", *Culture Unbound*, Volume 5, 2013: 251–271. Hosted by Linköping University Electronic Press: <http://www.cultureunbound.ep.liu.se>

Film:

The Cider House Rules [film]. Directed by Lasse HALLSTRÖM. USA, Buena Vista Pictures, 1999.

Screenplay:

IRVING, John. *The Cider House Rules. Final Script*. 1999. The Daily Script. 25 Oct. 2016. Available from https://www.dailyscript.com/scripts/cider_house_rules.html

Online sources:

GUSSOW, Mel. *A Novelist Builds Out from Fact to Reach the Truth; John Irving Begins with His Memories*. In: *The New York Times* [online]. April 28, 1998. [quot. April 25, 2019]. ISSN 0362-4331. Available from: <https://www.nytimes.com/1998/04/28/books/novelist-builds-fact-reach-truth-john-irving-begins-with-his-memories.html>

RAVITZ, Jessica: *The Surprising History of Abortion in the United States*. [online]. June 27. 2016. [quot. June 4, 2019]. Available from: <https://edition.cnn.com/2016/06/23/health/abortion-history-in-united-states/index.html>.

SMITH, Dinitia. *While Excavating Past, John Irving Finds His Family*. In: *The New York Times*. [online]. June 27. 2005. [quot. April 25, 2019]. ISSN 0362-4331. Available from: <https://www.nytimes.com/2005/06/28/books/while-excavating-past-john-irving-finds-his-family.html>

John Irving [online]. Scottsdale (Arizona). [quoted 2019-05-17]. Available from: www.john-irving.com

Česko-Slovenská filmová databáze © 2001-2019 [online]. POMO Media Group s.r.o. [quoted 2019-06-1]. Available from: www.csfd.cz

IMDb.com, Inc. © 1990-2019, [online]. Seattle (Washington). [quoted 2019-06-12] Available from: www.imdb.com

Bibliography of John Irving

Novels:

- Setting Free the Bears* (1968, Random House; ISBN 0-345-21812-4)
The Water-Method Man (1972, Random House; ISBN 0-394-47332-9)
The 158-Pound Marriage (1974, Random House; ISBN 0-394-48414-2)
The World According to Garp (1978, E. P. Dutton; ISBN 0-525-237770-4)
The Hotel New Hampshire (1981, E. P. Dutton; ISBN 0-525-12800-X)
The Cider House Rules (1985, William Morrow; ISBN 0-688-03036-X)
A Prayer for Owen Meany (1989, William Morrow; ISBN 0-688-07708-0)
A Son of a Circus (1994, Random House; ISBN 0-679-43496-8)
A Widow for One Year (1998, Random House; ISBN 0-375-50137-1)
The Fourth Hand (2001, Random House; ISBN 0-375-50627-6)
Until I Find You (2005, Random House; ISBN 1-4000-6383-3)
Last Night in Twisted River (2009, Random House; ISBN 0-4000-6384-1)
In One Person (2012, Simon & Schuster; ISBN 9781451664126)
Avenue of Mysteries (2015, Simon & Schuster; ISBN 9781451664164)

Non-fiction:

- The Imaginary Girlfriend* (1995, Random House; ISBN 9780345458261)
My Movie Business. A Memoir (1999, Random House; ISBN 978-0-345-44130-0)

Other:

- Trying to Save Piggy Sneed* (collection, 1996, Arcade Publishing; ISBN 1-55970-323-7)
The Cider House Rules: A Screenplay (1999)
A Sound Like Someone Trying Not to Make a Sound (2004, Doubleday Books for Young Readers; ISBN 0-38574680-6)

Filmography Based on Writings:

The World According to Garp (1982, directed by G. R. Hill, Warner Bros.)

The Hotel New Hampshire (1984, directed by T. Richardson, Orion Pictures)

Simon Birch (1998, directed by M. S. Johnson, Buena Vista Pictures) – partly based on *A Prayer for Owen Meany*

The Cider House Rules (1999, directed by L. Hallström, Buena Vista Pictures)

The Door in the Floor (2004, directed by T. Williams, Focus Features) – from *A Widow for One Year*

The Cast⁶³

In credits order

Tobey Maguire	...	Homer Wells
Charlize Theron	...	Candy Kendall
Delroy Lindo	...	Mr. Rose
Paul Rudd	...	Wally Worthington
Michael Caine	...	Dr. Wilbur Larch
Jane Alexander	...	Nurse Edna
Kathy Baker	...	Nurse Angela
Erykah Badu	...	Rose Rose
Kieran Culkin	...	Buster
Kate Nelligan	...	Olive Worthington
Heavy D	...	Peaches
K. Todd Freeman	...	Muddy
Paz de la Huerta	...	Mary Agnes
J.K. Simmons	...	Ray Kendall
Evan Parke	...	Jack
Jimmy Flynn	...	Vernon
Lonnie Farmer	...	Hero

⁶³ Source: https://www.imdb.com/title/tt0124315/fullcredits?ref_=tt_cl_sm#cast

Erik Per Sullivan	...	Fuzzy
Spencer Diamond	...	Curly
Sean Andrew	...	Copperfield
John Albano	...	Steerforth
Skye McCole Bartusiak	...	Hazel
Clare Daly	...	Clara
Colin Irving	...	Major Winslow
Annie Corley	...	Carla
Patrick Donnelly	...	Adopting Father
Edie Schechter	...	Adopting Mother
Kasey Berry	...	12yr. Old Girl
Mary Bogue	...	Big Dot
Victoria Stankiewicz	...	Debra
Christine Stevens	...	Florence
Earle C. Batchelder	...	Dr. Holtz
Norma Fine	...	Mrs. Goodhall
John Irving	...	Stationmaster

Résumé

Tato bakalářská práce se zabývá přístupem Johna Irvinga k adaptování jeho románu *Pravidla moštárny* (1985) do filmové podoby (1999). Práce sleduje autorův pracovní postup a porovnává román a film pomocí analýzy románu, filmu a scénáře. V práci je popsána většina odlišností, které jsou porovnávány s autorovým odůvodněním daných změn. Závěrem se práce také dotýká tématu potratů a jejich významu v románové a filmové verzi *Pravidel moštárny*.

ANNOTATION

Jméno a příjmení:	Martina Kopecká
Katedra:	Ústav cizích jazyků PdF UP Olomouc
Vedoucí práce:	Mgr. Petr Anténe, M. A., Ph. D.
Rok obhajoby:	2019

Název práce:	Porovnání románu Johna Irvinga <i>Pravidla moštárny</i> a jeho filmové adaptace
Název v angličtině:	A Comparison of John Irving's <i>The Cider House Rules</i> and Its Film Adaptation
Anotace práce:	Tato bakalářská práce se zaměřuje na srovnání románu <i>Pravidla moštárny</i> , napsaného Johnem Irvingem v roce 1985, a jeho filmovou adaptací (Miramax, 1999). Práce porovnává nejvýraznější rozdíly mezi příběhem vyprávěným v originále a v adaptaci. Hlavní část práce se zabývá změnami, které byly provedeny v rámci jednotlivých postav, z důvodu omezení plynoucích z povahy filmu jako média. V 5. kapitole se práce zaměřuje na nestranné zhodnocení kontroverzního téma potratů.
Klíčová slova:	John Irving, <i>Pravidla moštárny</i> , román, film, scénář, adaptace, porovnání, postavy, potraty.
Anotace v angličtině:	This bachelor thesis aims to compare the novel <i>The Cider House Rules</i> , written by John Irving in 1985, and its film adaptation (Miramax, 1999). The thesis compares the most important differences between the story featured in the original and the adaptation. The main part deals with changes made for individual characters in the context of limitations of film as medium. In chapter 5 the thesis aims to impartially refer to the controversial topic of abortions.
Klíčová slova v angličtině:	John Irving, <i>The Cider House Rules</i> , novel, film, screenplay, adaptation, comparison, characters, abortions.
Přílohy vázané v práci:	Bibliography of John Irving The Cast
Rozsah práce:	33 normostran
Jazyk práce:	anglický

